

**CITIZENS' DOCUMENT**

<b>S.N.</b>	<b>TOPIC</b>	<b>PG. NOS.</b>
<b>I.</b>	<b><u>MAAF KARO MAHA "RAJ" TO KSHAMA KJIYE SHIV "RAJ"</u></b> (31/3 YRS OF SHIVRAJ 4.0)	<b>2-14</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b><u>"POORVA" TO "AVASHYAMBHAVI" CM</u></b> (31/3 YRS OF NATH 2.0)	<b>15-16</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b><u>AJAB –GAJAB TO AJEEBO – GAREEB</u></b> ( 31/3 yrs of BJP rule ) ( Wonderful- Amazing to Weird -Crooked )	<b>17-19</b>
<b>IV.</b>	<b><u>STUNNED TO WARY</u></b> (31/3 Yrs - Cong. Opposition ) ( Congress Mukht To Bjp Yukt. )	<b>20</b>
<b>V.</b>	<b><u>UPDATES</u></b>  ( Politics , Elections , Legislation , Governance , Admn., Ministrywise report , Media , Law )	<b>21-51</b>
<b>VI.</b>	<b><u>ADDENDUM :</u></b>  ( 18 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>4</sub> yrs. of BJP Rule ;17yrs of Shivraj ; 15 months of Kamalnath ; Mission Kamal v/s Operation Lotus.).	<b>56-90</b>
<b>VII</b> .	<b><u>CITIZENS' REPORT CARD</u></b> ( Incl.Scams &mafia;Data points )	<b>91—96*</b>
<b>VIII</b> .	<b><u>CITIZENS' VISION :</u></b> ( M.P. in Post Covid world; Crystal Gazing – predictions VS 2023 )	<b>*96-102*</b>
	<b><u>COVID DOCUMENT</u></b>	
<b>IX .</b>	<b>COVID- 1/2/3 .</b>	<b>*102-111*</b>
<b>X .</b>	<b>DARK COVID .</b>	<b>*111-118</b>

**MAAF KARO MAHA “RAJ ” TO KSHAMA KIJIYE SHIV “RAJ ”.**

( EXCUSE US- HIS “ MAJESTY ”- TO PARDON US- “LORD” SHIVRAJ )

(31/3 YRS OF SHIVRAJ 4.0)

**Shashidhar .S. Kapur**

Shivraj meticulously crafted the image of *Maama* (maternal uncle ) over a decade ... It became so successful that other BJP leaders – viz. Utrakhand CM- followed suit. Hence the expectation was that he would live up to it in the COVID period...In fact ,the anticipation was that he'd try and build it up - to *Mamaji*. Shivraj in his fourth innings had two options - correct past wrongs or get even more brazen ; reform or deform. More often than not the ones with a winners' mindset get better while those with a **loser's state** become bitter.

Via normal routes Shivraj coming again would have been a blessing - at least in mid short term- for the state. He is the most **sympathetic** and **industrious** CM we've had even though he lacks a Vision and sensitivity. Entry by abnormal methods often entails a curse. Since he came thru the back door ( not by re-election) chances of latter were more...( In fact ,it was almost predictable that he would tread the dark route - given the fact that initially too he had become CM via trap door).

At the outset in **2020**, Chouhan had said this term would be **different...** Yet from the moment Shivraj switched the ignition he was driving with hand brakes applied. Someone used to standing tall in state politics in the decade long absence of Diggi , Kamalnath ,Uma Bharti had to withhold himself and was forced to share status with Scindia. Moreover , he had to accept the Independence of Scindia camp of ministers and digest the autonomy of Cabinet faction comprising Kamal Patel, Gopal Bhargava and Vijay Shah –something he never faced in the previous terms.

Only a few things could be marked as purely **Shivraj Success** in Covid1.0- Appointing a medico as Health Minister ( alongwith a doctor as health commissioner-later unseated by the bureaucratic lobby ) and *Shram Siddhi* scheme for labourers - for **lives and livelihood** respectively ; universal inclusion

into ration scheme or enhanced MNREGA work were mere tweaking of Congress' food security bill and NREGA ; highest implementation of Hawkers' loan and PM housing schemes merely complementing the central initiatives.

As someone who derived energy from people, Shivraj mostly abstained during Covid 1.0. Initially, for a few days he did venture out but thereafter confined himself to *Mantralya* .The lame excuse was that CM's visit would've disturbed discipline .That flew in the face of a full house oath taking , political meets et al .Shivraj neither visited hot spots , nor did he bother to go to the villages of migrant labour. Video conferencing merely complemented face to face dealing on the spot but was no substitute for it... From “ **Virtuous Shivraj** ” he became “ **Virtual Chouhan** ” during lockdowns of Covid1.0. Incidentally , Boris Johnson didn't stop meeting citizens – faced Corona and recovered ( Chouhan met mostly party / RSS workers / officials till the end of lockdown)...If the CM shows hesitation and fear ,ordinary citizens get depressed .After taking reigns, he could not accelerate- someone who used to be from one to ten in Cabinet couldn't even get his own men inducted .There were speed breakers immediately after crossing the hurdle of formation as Shivraj couldn't get the departments of choice for his men. Thus at a time when hand brakes had to be released and speed breakers removed , CM was driving with both. Worse still , he had to appoint a few undeserving new Mla's-even first timers- as ministers so as to give them an edge in elections-all this while when deserving candidates within the party sulked. Without the right man at the right spot , the scope for good governance shrunk.

When the *Maama* vehicle crashed, it was taken to a fancy workshop raising doubts about claims of safety. After Shivraj reported Corona Positive he went to a **private hospital**...If the CM - esp. one who is in *Pratham Sewak* mould - cannot trust his own government hospitals , how does one expect the last man to have faith in them ? . Even more so when it is a question of life and death. On the other hand , one of his top bureaucrats opted for Hamidia hospital- no wonder the government gives the impression of being led by *Babus*.

**Lockdown period was the “reverse “ of earlier Shivraj Regimes** – Lock down 1.0 was the darkest in Shivraj 4.0 ; Lockdown 4.0 is considered less dark despite much greater numbers in that the darkness became “ known ” ,even if unseen. As the stage wise unlock plan played out, the invisible aspects of various

lockdown phases spilled out in the open. As for the migrant labour fiasco who is to be blamed ? It is no secret that being centrally located and underdeveloped most **labourers** -esp. unskilled-migrate from M.P. So , their **maximum flow** to the state should've been anticipated. Perhaps if there was a labour minister at that point in time, things might have been better handled – What is the excuse ? No phone numbers of officers were made Public and there were no ministers – Who could the labourers contact ? Both were Shivraj's decision- in not having a cabinet for over a month and handpicking the officers. It was a systemic failure and collective shame.

**Leading from behind** and **Guarding** are two different things - winning without fighting is always a hollow victory .Such a leader has no respect of the troops and seldom delivers – at least not what is expected .Chouhan was never a great leader for wartime or growth but he missed the chance of being the guardian of crisis / relief by his partisan approach in Covid 1.0. In that he merely followed the Modi Model of **Populist politics** and **autocratic governance**– not sharing responsibility and service but apportioning complete blame to opposition and minorities. Wherever the twin approach failed he resorted to whataboutery-the problems remained unaddressed.

Shivraj 4.0 appeared more like *Bhasmaarti* of people in Covid 1.0 ; he took the state from *farzi* ( doctored statistics ) to *Jhootha*( Fake data) viz. Claim about IIFA funds ,Sambal, Agri Insurance etc. Shivraj's motto remained- ***Apna saath , Apno ka vikaas ,apne Jaison ka vishwas and Doosron ka prayas..*** *Apna saath* is exemplified by self preservation in giving free hand to RSS -particularly in Lockdown1.0 ; development of own people - unleashing BJP mining lobby, patronising private healthcare ( *Apno ka sath* by implication ) and **partisan targeting of relief** showcases winning over like minded voters ( *sirf apne jaison ka vishwas* ).At least post unlockdown CM and / or HM should've been on the hotspots frequently- they weren't...The **Kill corona** campaign died a quiet death - esp. in second version- with no challans fined or masks distributed. Not a single innovative approach was undertaken...The good work came mostly from Individual good Samaritans , Social bodies – albeit for their own people , Sikhs , some other minority groups ...Exemplifying *Doosron ka Prayas*.

If Shivraj had succeeded in Covid 1.0, he would've been a phantom.... On the other hand, only **four factoids** are enough to prove he was a **superflop**- both in lives and livelihood-**Highest death rate**, least number of tests (even among the bottom ten states), Death/ despair of migrant labourers and serving the longest without a cabinet in India (after KCR) ... Some Heroes were honoured but no failures were castigated/shamed nor were culprits been punished / penalized. In a war, anyone backing out could be shot by his own troops. ( If Corona Handling was indeed seen as “ war” by Shivraj .)

Shivraj's diligence is unquestioned. In Covid 1.0, he took it to the next level. Perhaps this the hardest Chauhan has ever worked. Slogging round the clock, he ensured that the system delivered. However, the moot question remains - Hard work for what? Delivery to whom? For the first 8 months, almost the entire energy was focused on Gwalior Chambal and other By poll(s) areas. Thus the hard work was for personal good and delivery was distorted.

Chouhan 4.0 kept saying that he is not merely to occupy the CM's chair but to transform the state; also talked about Economic activity. Emulating the Kamalnath template, he shamelessly usurped Nath's schemes - whether three fourth jobs for locals or tough stance against mafia or decimating middlemen. No harm in continuing good stuff but **credit** must be given where due. It sounds even more hypocritical when many fingers point towards him about sand mafia, in the direction of RSS for education mafia, at BJP for land mafia and so on. The fact that for every key decision CM had to rush to Delhi – from cabinet formation to portfolio allocation to approval of *Atmanirbhar* roadmap ... Where was Shivraj in it? A **glorified bureaucrat**?

As the saying goes, you can make some people *Maamus* all the time ( fool them ), others sometimes but you cannot make everybody a *Maamu* all the time... In the end, Shivraj may become the biggest *Maamu* – irritating the Public who defeated him and hated by Delhi- all of whom try to humiliate him, cut to size, make him helpless / drink *Vish* (poison) in his own words ... He was on road to becoming a *VISHRAJ*. Chouhan's performance in Covid 1.0 was more like *Kansa Maama* or *Shakuni Mama* (Those who grab power by trickery and exploit the masses)... A real *Maama* cares for others; *Shakuni* is *Swayam Sewak* (self serving). The fact is that Shivraj is used to two thirds majority - and has proven

unfit for a razor thin majority. Besides , he perhaps got carried away by his own **artificially built image** of a big leader – conveniently forgetting that if Nath , Diggi and Uma would have been active in the state during his earlier stints , there would be **no triple Shivraj**...All in all , Chouhan in Covid 1.0 turned out to be odd. (*vichitra*) rather than “different” . All his actions in the first quarter confirmed the worst fears.

Oldtimers - esp. within BJP- may remember that Shivraj was the **original “Pappu”**...He became a *Majboor* ( helpless ) CM in Covid 1.0 – such a state is understandable in first term is but in the fourth ? On the basis of his performance in Covid1.0 Shivraj deserved the title of COVID MAAMU

...Time for course correction began slipping. Fake sensitivity combined with ruthless scheming will only take you so far. ..Having managed to win the bypolls , Chouhan knew that he had only as much time - at most six to eight months - of the **second wave** to salvage the lost ground or be consigned to the dustbin of history as someone who ruled the state longest without **structurally transforming** it. Duly, he set about in turbo charged mode. Shivraj and team post unlockdown 4.0 were expected to at least provide safety henceforth. –in the engagement stage .In the 4 months following it , governance was mostly in resuscitation mode due to lack of funds ,budget presentations, strong opposition , uneasy intra party dynamics ,VS session et al. Ironically, the pace post re-election slackened both in lives and livelihood issues .Quarantine centres were closed , social restrictions eased ,surveys reduced ,Corona volunteers eased out... At the end of first year, the state stood relatively at the same place with respect to heartland states albeit better prepared .Consequently , Covid fatigue set in.

In **Covid 2.0**, Shivraj set about a twofold makeover 2021 onwards. Firstly, to counter detractors of his sissy image ,he presented a tough administrator *Avataar* .The problem is when you’ve come thru a backdoor, how can you expect others to be upfront ? When legislators being bought is an open secret , how can retail corruption be checked ? The second aspect of image refurbishing is consolidating the hardcore Hindutva image ( both as a bulwark against Modi- Shah adventurism as also to ward off Kailash Vijayvargiya - Uma Bharti hardcore challenge ) - more so with soft Hindutva being imbibed by Congress. Saying that “ No schools would be allowed to become breeding grounds for terrorists” was in line with the newer

version. In a sense he perhaps tried to overcompensate for the grey areas. To buttress it further he's gave own spin to Kamalnath model- Of continuing the attack on land mining mafia , transfer posting , war on adulterators etc- albeit in a partisan way to target Congressmen. That served a triple purpose– of building up a strongman image in public eye , pushing back the opposition and providing revenge for partymen whose illegal structures were demolished by Nath. All this while Chouhan has kept the template of his past regimes unaltered - going for PR overkill ,Media management and being in perpetual election mode. For instance continuing hype.“ Rising Madhya Pradesh ” ; doing *Swasthya Satyagraha* and planting one sapling daily in the same park in full camera glare - altogether spending 19 crores in media messaging in Covid1.0 alone ...By the way, “ In which parameter did M.P rise ?”- Resurrecting / Resuscitating would be a more appropriate phrase.; Is it the job of a CM to sit on *Satyagraha* – whether about *Kisan* (farmers) or in *Swasthya*(health) ? *Satyagraha* is for people who are not in power -influencers. Showing your mug 24/7 whether by planting a tree or social appeals –is image building on public money. By planting daily in Smart city park Chouhan is surreptitiously enforcing his legacy on the heart of Bhopal- in the absence of anything more concrete. Later , the park may be called “ Shivraj Park ” even if it is not formally named so. Being continuously in electoral mode has meant that the focus is on here and now always , to spread the rupee into maximum votes – to do small things in a big way – thereby big ticket ,long term stuff never gets done until a crisis. An example is the statement that nobody could've anticipated the severity of second wave. It made little sense ( read nonsense ) - virtually every mathematical projection ( including ours ) as also the history of second waves being more severe in previous Pandemics pointed to it. Inability to integrate and rationalise the advice of doctors and officers meant outsourcing the Covid battle to them. If they had succeeded the credit would be of Shivraj ; that the approach failed , he tried to absolve himself . If Politicians will not deal with unknowable / unanticipated - who will ? The excuse makes him merely an election winning machine who happens to be a supra bureaucrat- with political immunity.

In this phase, the few **good things** that were done include -,presenting a roadmap , Greater Engagement with SHG's , focus on delivery , forming milk cooperatives , microcredit to hawkers, spreading rural roads , one district one

product scheme besides sympathy and diligence. As for the worst stuff, it includes - Appeasing RSS , mismanaging migrant labour ,lying and communalizing. Every party favours its grassroots bodies but nobody “appeases” them-even within the BJP ruled states nowhere is the RSS as pampered as in M.P. and even within BJP governments in the state Shivraj takes the cake in obliging *Sanghis* ; every state mismanaged migrant labour – only that M.P. fared worst , every state “doctored” figures and data- Shivraj “lied” ( “ invented ” figures). Amid crisis any government is supposed to provide succor to the masses and relief to the marginalised. Shivraj 4.0 went almost in the **opposite** direction-ditching poor migrant labour midway – many had to return to metros failing to get work in villages , bashing middle class - no relief in prices of essentials like petrol , electricity , food stuff ; on top , local bodies taxes were proposed to be raised substantially ( suspended later due to hue and cry) . Moreover , there was duplicity all a round - fudging data , exhorting others to go to government hospitals while going to private facility himself , making over the top promises around bypolls and later withdrawing even allotted funds esp. from losing constituencies – e.g. Morena .All these amount to punishing the poor- a trait of *Neech* ( Lowly ; not low caste).Slipping once is a mistake ; repeating it is a **crime** – in Covid 1.0 for over a month there was no health minister ; in Covid 2.0 once again for the first month the health minister was busy in Damoh elections. In the same vein ,Chouhan took hype ( his weakness of earlier terms) to the next level. For instance, claims of having made 2 cr Ayushman cards ( whereas it is a documented fact that most private hospitals refused to entertain them till it was decided to allow 5 people in family on the same card at the end of Covid 2.0 . It was a shame in that much developed southern states utilized Ayushman much better with greater number of beneficiaries while a developing state like M.P lagged.). The next target set is to make 4 cr. cards - which means around 10-20 cr. entitlements - more than twice the entire population of M.P... It is a recipe for **another scam** – like PDS ration cards scam in the previous term wherein many more cards than beneficiaries were made.

All in all , Shivraj adopted a **twofold strategy** in this term -Reviving own previous schemes and maxing the Central schemes.Thus he behaved more like a **Lt. Governor** - over enthusiastically following Delhi and running the show with bureaucrats - than a Chief minister with inclusive and participatory approach.



At the end of Covid 2.0 , Chouhan tried to salvage the situation by: **smart vaccination**: age –cum-region approach besides **avoiding** those healthy among 18-45 group who have recovered from Covid till half the population got at least one jab., Among the most important things to be done was **documentation** – visually , audio and writing. This was once in a century data which will serve as benchmark for all schemes... Without this primary data ,the Roadmap will have roadblocks .**Two key demands** for Covid 3.0 were–firstly ,to act only/mostly on the basis of statistical models based on the data documentation of Madhya Pradesh .That was the **only** chance to come tops among BIMARU states ; the inability to use mathematical projections in Covid 1.0 cost the state a lifetime opportunity to convert the crisis into opportunity-and leapfrog into the category of developed states... Initially, with no data available –unknowable situation- only math and philosophy could’ve made sense ; now that there was plenty of data , only Statistical experts and ideologues could use it sensibly. **Second demand** was to ,postpone the Local bodies / Panchayat elections beyond the date whenever **half** the population was vaccinated – at least one dose- request the courts to have a relook (Bihar govt. had done it ) –That was accepted ; **Two secondary demands** were to share the campaign against Covid with the opposition in a meaningful and concrete manner- beyond mere lip service and tokenism... If it flopped , the blame can be shared and in case it succeeded ,a new template for cooperative politics would be created in Madhya Pradesh. In any case , the challenge was too big for any government to handle alone. There could be no better occasion than this to rise above party politics - to prove your “**Pradeshbhakti / Pradesh Prem**” ; data management and documentation ; be **absolutely transparent** about data–fudging data backfires on government in two ways- initially it kills the poorest and later the capable sections become complacent thereby deepening the crisis; Only authentic documentation will ensure correct planning and vision; only credible data can guarantee workable roadmap; **two tertiary demands** were to do some kind of cash transfer(DBT/ cash coupons etc ) -giving 1000/- to hawkers is fine but ought to be extended to BPL youth too -and no more corona curfew or lockdowns in third wave–only **Corona 144** by the government and / or Corona **boltdown** by citizen bodies / NGO’s as SOS... A small window still existed to end up being the best Covid handler among BIMARU states post Covid - overtaking Rajasthan ( the chance to leapfrog into the comity of developed states was missed due to mishandling of

Covid 1.0...The alternate scenario of succumbing to third / fourth waves could push the state into BIMARU trap for a generation. So , while a temporary small window still exists for Shivraj to end up as “Overman’ / Aurobindo (Opportunity of becoming a “phantom” was lost in Covid 1.0 and that of being a “superman” scuttled in Covid 2.0) .

Post Covid 2.0 a shameless version of Shivraj has emerged - with posters / hoardings thanking for vaccination in the face of shortage ; being thick skinned amid cabinet fracas; sticking to his version of Covid despite clinching evidence on the contrary... He stayed away from the last stages of Damoh by election -to protect his image. In that he has succeeded somewhat - at least in the eyes of people outside the state. That he was named the second most popular CM among heartland states during Covid by a national survey is a testimony.

The **third year** of current Shivraj Term , post April 2022 onwards began with a minor scare of a third wave which didn't materialize ...Next on agenda was the Panchayat and Local bodies' elections which were made a football among parties with Election commission and courts esp. on the issue of OBC reservations and the format of elections. Shivraj knew that any slip in it – at least major - would reignite calls of his replacement .Hence he went all out to win by all means - fair or otherwise thereby converting elections into a war. Hence the mortal animosity among major parties.

Once elections got over, remaining part of the year was mostly spent in event management mode – another leaf from Modi Template- From continual to continuous : Cheetah translocation , *Mahakaal* corridor inauguration , G20 meet , *Pravasi Sammellan* et al..Much of it was a ploy -a Dhoni like approach to take the match to the last leg so that there would be no option then(TINO). Chouhan used Covid as godsent opportunity to entrench himself which some other lightweight BJP Chief ministers couldn't. He converted the crisis into an opportunity for himself and cronies – not necessarily for the state and party.

To sum , Shivraj 4.0 has been the **worst in living memory** of any Chief Minister –**including his own previous terms**. Faced with a once in a century pandemic, the response was shocking . Least responsible- everything by Ordinance ;Percentage wise , perhaps there has been no greater corruption in a

single term than the Covid period- over one lakh crore borrowed from market with no accountability-including dodging the Assembly. The proclamation of borrowing endlessly doesn't hold scrutiny...market borrowings are always for growth purposes not for social security ( for that there are non – mkt / govt. / international bodies / development agencies) .Else , you're mortgaging the future – even pushing into a debt trap. A factory of scams - never as many scams in only one term .The entire approach has been non- inclusive and non-participatory/ partially participatory after constitution of crisis management committees.. .How can a government handle crisis without active engagement of opposition ? Without involving the Citizens' bodies meaningfully ? Without transparency in the expenses ? Without fixing responsibility upon the defaulters ?... In doing more of the same despite failures, Chouhan seems to have risen to his level of “**incompetence**”.

Till bypolls , Shivraj focused on becoming *Atmanirbhar* in tandem with Scindia : who is **ATM**-nirbhar .The duo could afford to be Independent of both National parties- a euphemism for blackmail. Post results , they set about making their acolytes *ATM*nirbhar and themselves *Atm*nirbhar respectively. The joint photo with a tiger at the end of one year showed that it is a “ **Mahashivraj Sarkar**” ( Maharaj- cum-Shivraj ) with pretensions of being TINO ( There is no option – beyond the duo ) till 2023 and beyond. The background represented their camps. However , he is well aware of the many “ Pokhrans” waiting to happen. The others - citizens as well as dissidents- cannot stay “ *Paramatmnirbhar* ” for too long. Pushed to the wall, they may press the button- of EVM's and /or pull the rug from under the feet. In this context rumours of replacement became punters' favourite pastime in the state during the term .

For most part in this term Shivraj was more like CM of Madhya Bharat and a few departments- all the senior members either have been imported or belong to various factions. While masses see him as **Janta Raja** ( people's ruler) ,rivals within the party view him as **Jantu Khaja** ( poisonous predator )..Hence a **Chakravyuh** ( labyrinth) of sorts was created regionwise . There Comprising Vishnoi in Mahkaushal , Malaiya in Bundelkhand besides top job aspirants such as Narendra Tomar and Gopal Bhargava...Only a reverse *Chakravyuh* – by a man to man marking in the regions- Arvind Bhadoriya , Vishwas Sarang , Bhupendra

Singh , Sanjay Pathak , Rampal Singh besides obliging loyal MLAs with positions in Corporations and Boards gave a fighting chance..

Shivraj began the fourth term as **TINA** ( there is no alternative ) and has converted it to **TINO**(There is no Option) towards the home run. At the end of three years ,Chouhan is now in total election mode round the clock ...It began with the Budget 2023 followed by launching more vote catching schemes like “Laadli Behna” and “ Mukhya Mantri Yuva Kaushal Seekho-Kamao Yojana ( CM skill building-cum-earning scheme)” besides daily promises...

**Broadly speaking, what is now expected ?** Every election brings a new flavor...This time sparring among Shivraj and Kamalnath has begun albeit in a pseudo Presidential mode with each leader asking the other one question daily in the media. As voting day approaches , this is likely to degenerate into a prime example of Post truth and alternate reality...Come elections and Shivraj is a different man ... Breakneck campaigning ,carpet bombing of media, attacks on opposition , rebels, yatras , road shows ,rallies, temple running...One new angle this time is likely to be the (mis)use of government agencies against not merely opponents but also against rebels within the party...Fabricated cases ,rampaging Bulldozers , and concocted beneficiaries is likely to be the cocktail of this season...

What could **various probable scenarios** mean for Shivraj ? If 2003 won by a big margin 2024 LS too comfortable then Shivraj is likely to be removed ...

If slender margin in state and big victory at Centre ,the Scindia lobby could be used to oust him –the duo may exchange places ..

If both state and centre won by thin majority, then Shivraj has the best chance to continue...

If state lost by minor margin and a big victory at centre may mean a sinecure position for Chouhan...

If major defeat in the state and slender victory at centre Shivraj might be shooed towards a party position

If Major loss in the state and slender defeat at Centre Chouhan may be pushed to political wilderness

If major defeat both at state and centre ,Mama may face existential crisis , politically speaking...

As of now, Shivraj is in “ **Raja Maamu** ” avataar\_ appearing everywhere and any where around a crowd ; little content and great packaging ; image building, branding , communicating- delivering only small things in a big way...Chouhan’s tenure would form a case study whether in modern day 24/7 politics anyone can do justice to more than two terms without becoming jaded ... If push comes to shove , this ATMnirbhar backed Lt. Governor - allowed to continue- may try to become Independent Governor General. No self respecting party will allow that.

Having slipped in Covid 3.0 / 4.0 too , Chouhan is likely to be marked as a **Covid criminal** ( The term used by VD Sharma for those flouting Covid appropriate behavior ). **Our take** is that no amount of data doctoring will dilute Covid criminality nor wash Covid sins of hiding deaths .It is impossible to escape justice -even if temporal courts fail, divine Judgment is infallible. We think that the highest probability is that his stint as CM is over and there is all likelihood June 2024 is expiry date of his electoral politics. If despite all the odds , Chouhan is able to flip *MahaShivraj* Sarkar to **ShivMaharaj** sarkar, or even retain political relevance ,his reputation as a **Baazigar** ( mountebank ) among insiders will gain currency among outsiders also- we too would doff the hat and upgrade him from *Baazigar* to *Jadugar* (magician).

\*\*\*

### **Shortlist of good /dark stuff**

#### **GOOD**

- Covid ( Vaccination Drive ; forming Crisis committees).
- Delivery of social security initiatives.
- Postponing Local Bodies elections in view of Covid 2.0.( later preventing further slide from VS elections)
- Announcing setting up of a State Statistical service.
- New Schemes : for Mahua Heritage wine/ Kadaknath rearing by SHG’s

- Extrapolating Past schemes : Ladli Behna scheme (1000/- p.m. to eligible women)
- Reviving Populist schemes ( Laptop, Scooty ,cycle)
- Promising Implementation of PESA.
- Promotion of Self Help Groups of women- engaging them for contracts worth 25 K cr.
- Various New Policies: Excise ,Mining, Industry, tourism, Youth etc.(albeit in the final year)
- CM rise schools ,Global Skills Park.
- Best performing Double Engine : PM Schemes : 10 awards( Housing ,Nal-Jal etc.)

### DARK

- Govt. formation by cheating
- Lying in Assembly –Kisan Loans data.
- Malgovernance :No cabinet for nearly two months in Covid 1.0 ( when it was most needed); Reviving Defunct/ Controversial schemes(viz.Sambal)
- Covid mismanagement : Reverse approach -calling it a “war” ( If Covid “ crisis ” was a “war” then what is Ukraine conflict –a “ crisis”? ); No documentation of Covid .
- Data dark- Blocking key data- viz. no data available for unemployment.
- Resource colonization - Mines , Forests , water Land - to cronies.(even leasing upto 50 yrs ..that too in the last three months)
- Communalisation - Insinuating Hindu appeasement.viz.saying that “No schools would be allowed to become breeding grounds for terrorists”.

**P.S.:** If positive is as much as dark – how is Shivraj the worst CM , Best Mukhya Sewak ?...Opportunity cost of Politicising administration , lack of ratio in designing of schemes, lack of proportion in delivery,misplaced priorities ; Single point focus on electoral gains viz. 1000/- pm were demanded for poor women during Covid 2.0 peak - it was denied as no election was approaching , debt from Mkt. for Freebies ( instead of development programmes) has made him a populist –catering merely to Popular demands than Public Interest...All this is proof enough that he came in as a Cheat Minister (thru sabotage) and survived as Cheap Minister ( With cheap tricks) \*\*\*

## “ POORVA” TO “ AVASHYAMBHAVI ” CM

( 31/3 YRS OF NATH 2.0 )

### Positive

- Micromanaging party activities.
- Greater engagement with workers .
- Leaving LOP to focus on party work .
- Good rapport with Digvijay.
- Fighting every by-election with full gusto.
- Survey approach for transparency.
- No-nonsense public statements.
- Promising 1500 pm to women –nimble approach; 500/- for gas cylinders.

### Dark

- Second rung not promoted enough : Arun Yadav, Ajay Singh .
- Computer and other Babas( Bageshwar ) remain hangers-on.
- Some close aides leaving viz. Saluja
- Downplaying VS- No confidence motion.
- No alternative vision- merely reiterating pre-Covid pronouncements.
- Banking on Citizens’ anti Incumbency
- No talk about Covid – its long term impact .
- Hoping to encash residents’ sympathy - for having lost govt. to back stabbers.
- Abrasive outbursts continue viz. Mla Kya Hota hai ...?
- Insisting on brazenly promoting Nakul Nath aggressively e.g.Making him a speaker at Priyanka Gandhi’s Gwalior rally : perhaps wants him to occupy Scindia’s space in Gandhi Household.

Verdict : Legacy doesn’t merely mean longevity in the same space (Chhindwara / Mahakaushal ) but also spread across regions and class...Last chance for redemption...*Avashyambhavi* C.E.O : *Sambhavit Pratham Sevak /Mukhiya* .

\*\*\*

PARTY( Congress Legislative wing )

## Positive

- Commendable results in the 28 By -elections ; winning performance in other by elections..
- Organisation strengthened till booth level.
- Enhanced focus on workers.
- Improved Media presence – better spokesperson .
- Enhanced social media engagement -even better than BJP in patches .
- Reclaiming credit : viz.Mahakal- claim of having designed , initiated revamp.
- Great performance in Local bodies & Panchayat elections .
- Kept a united face barring a few incidents- Nominal factionalism
- Bringing in a **Black Paper** of the Govt.

## Dark

- No confidence motion a damp squib.
- Not demanding a session on Covid - White paper
- No talk about electoral reform No raising demand for anti -subversion law ( When anti – defection law proved inadequate )
- Not vociferously raising the numerous scams.
- Second rung off radar .
- No Ghar wapasi of defectors
- No continuous activity – only continual- on ground
- Not enough meetings ...To keep workers engaged continuously.
- No shadow cabinet : as was mooted earlier.

P.S : Current LOP (Dr. Govind Singh)- Lacks dynamism; No confidence motion a damp squib.

\*\*\*

**AJAB –GAJAB TO AJEEBO - GAREEB**

**(31/3 yrs of BJP rule )**



( Wonderful- amazing to Weird -Crooked )

**Shashidhar.S. Kapur**

A tag line for Madhya Pradesh is “ *MP Ajab Hai , MP Gajab Hai* ”  
( MP is mysterious , MP is marvelous ) ...COVID provided the opportunity to turn the state in two different directions- becoming Unique , Special ( *Vishesh , Vishisht* ) from weird ,oddball ( *vichitra ,vidrup*) in positive aspects and from convoluted , distorted ( *aada , teda*) to reverse , perverse ( *Ulta ,Pulta* ) in dark facets - depending upon its approach. As in other aspects, Corona virus had the tendency to deepen pre- existing faults ; Corona **warriors** and **heroes** were to ensure that the state and its citizens emerge even stronger from it by enhancing the pre -existing strengths .On the other hand , Corona **carriers** and **super spreaders** could threaten the lives and livelihoods.

One look at the end of **Corona** will make it clear that the state had a stumbling – fumbling approach. **Good** was incremental ( or a series of incrementalisms) but dark appeared quantum. **Positives** included the decision to revert to direct election for the Mayors, appointing a medico as health minister ( even if after a great delay) and another doctor as health Commissioner ; **Jeevan Shakti** scheme involving SHG’s of women to make masks, also involved them in Foodgrain procurement ;1000/- p.m. to families of over 2 lakh Sahariya , Bhariya , Baiga women and **Shramik Siddha scheme for urban labour** ; increasing the procurement date as also uptake of pulses and mustard.; FIR from home -pilot project in few stations... Among the **Grey steps** were postponing local Bodies’ elections ; tenure extended by one year ; Loan waivers of Farmers put on hold ; private traders allowed to procure at MSP outside Mandis ; Kisan Cabinet ; IIFA decision reversed ; **Sambal Scheme** revived ; ESMA for health services ; Honorariums and 50 L insurance for frontline health workers; electricity workers too covered subsequently ; Giving additional Charge of VC- Makhan Lal University to Secretary DPR initially and later appointing saffronite KG Suresh ; reactivated Anand Vibhag ; DA of employees put on hold for 3 months ; arrears of third installment of seventh pay commission withheld ; **100 unit** free electricity scheme stopped.; Maheshwar Mega Hydel Power contract annulled. Parole , bail duration enhanced due to COVID; Review of Kamal’s decisions of

last six months; Allowing MP/ Mlas on administrative posts in cooperatives and preparing a three year **roadmap** incorporating Peoples' suggestions .

**Dark** actions EOW case against Scindia closed ; Ghats demolished for illegal Sand Mining in Nasrullhgunj. Biggest politically regressive step of abandoniong Vidhan Parishad and New delimitation of wards. **COVID performance** on both the lives and livelihood fronts has been below par. Whether identifying , testing , tracking , tracing patients or handling of the migrant crisis , it left a lot to be desired. However , every dark cloud has a silver lining- while Covid Governance may have suffered , the political class as a whole innovated and improvised to remain relevant ; also **corona saviours** and protectors – paramedics/ doctors and policemen put up a good show.

Negativities which took years in previous innings have re-emerged within a semester . **Majoritarianism** - not involving the opposition; **One man show** - without a cabinet for record time. **Non- state actors** / RSS and extra constitutional authorities / unelected Mla's ruled the roost. A government controlled by cocky to brazen bureaucrats. Agri Economy shortchanged – nearly 5000 cr. reduction ; procurement from neighbouring states - Lalitpur ; PDS theft in Morena ; labour at the receiving end - new labour laws; Infant mortality rate once again the highest- though it is bipartisan.**Scams** too rose exponentially like corona- medical purchase scam, PDS scam ; inedible rice distribution ; Fake data claiming help to 16 lakh migrant labourers ; MNREGA impersonation etc. Mostly minor stuff – doing small things in a big way and tomtoming it; “Secretive” governance no transparency in administration ; all Big stuff hush hush- Budget, labour reforms ,market loans et al .A govt. of Television- while talking of Vision . No qualms about one way messaging on TV,Social media for most part of Corona1.0. Our take is that on this route, **Downfall too had to be proportionally quick this time and rationally steep.**

Basically a **fourfold approach** was adopted - cancelling ,reversing the decisions of Nath government- **ulatna** - and reviving the stuff from own past – **palatna** ;Implementing all central schemes the best, first - even when not needed, in order to be in the good books -(**bhakti**) lot of governance energy lost ; and copying the best practices of others without tweaking.( **nakal** )...Not

merely politically and in governance but in most other aspects too the state faltered.

All in all , the state has been turned on its head-**Reverse** polity – from Congress Mukta to Yukta; **reverse** governance - Disproportionate portfolios to Scindia’s unelected ministers ; **reverse** administration–officers castigated by BJP in past regime have plum positions ;**perverse imagination**- No Punishment to erring officers of health Deptt , nor to those in-charge of migrant labourers . In a sense it has become clear that only government has changed but governance remains the same ; in Administration the only choice now is between **dedicated** and/or **committed** -no option of faceless and neutral bureaucracy anymore. Overall direction is Reversed- from BIMARU to SUCHARU in Shivraj 1.0 , to RISING/ SWARNIM in Shivraj 2.0 to DUDHARU/ SAMRUDDHA in Shivraj 3.0 followed by a U-turn ATMANIRBAHAR in Shivraj 4.0

**Political mafia** and **Electoral contractors** have replaced all other mafia and contractors. Politicians are now more like employees of corporations ; candidates are akin to puppets in the hands of election strategists.Poor and unawakened voters of the region see it as “**new (ab)normal**” .While Citizens of M.P. may not be politically aware ,the point to be noted is that lack of political awareness doesn’t mean they’re inert - it only means they they’re criminally conscious .

To sum, M.P took a reverse-converse path. **Politics** without policies-only about individuals , events ,projects , schemes ;**Government without** cabinet , ministers without portfolios ;Vidhan Sabha without a speaker for long ( Pro Tem speaker Officiating) , no session ; Giving Charge for 10 days when CM Covid infected to 4 ministers (instead of one) ; **Politicians as administrators** and administrators as politicians in MP –in Cooperatives and as incharges of Districts during Covid 1.0 respectively ...Going by the above, new Tag line ought to be - **MP Ulat Hai ; Palat Hai ( MP is topsy ,turvy)**

\*\*\*

**STUNNED TO WARY**  
( CONGRESS MUKT TO BJP YUKT : 31/3 YRS CONG- OPPOSITION )

POSITIVE

- Great management of Bharat Jodo yatra -Good response .
- Revamped organisation till panchyat level.
- Enhanced social media engagement.
- Improved spokespersons .
- Creating Bal Congress
- Kept a united face barring a few incidents- Keeping the flock together.
- Enhanced focus on workers.
- Good tuning between LOP & PCC chief.

DARK

- Below average Covid performance-sub par social service.
- Playing with fire – in presenting Opposition in similar(not same) form as the ruling dispensation. : Soft Hindutva , competitive populism et al.
- Independent MLA –Shera- made in charge of welcoming Bharat Jodo Yatra entry in M.P.
- Not Presenting a Post Covid Vision; not internalized- not even communicated to partymen.
- Wating for citizens to overthrow BJP govt- no proactive approach on Congress's part.
- No continuous activity – only continual- on ground : Movements , p rotests only sporadic.
- Not enough activation - Frontal organizations /grassroots bodies not fully active..
- Not enough meetings ...To keep workers engaged continuously.
- No inner party elections ( Barring that for National President )... Not even seeking intra party voting on issues.

Verdict : This approach will lead to a change in government -without change in system ; for change , a “visionary” approach will have to complement the “populist” one.

\*\*\*

## UPDATES

### Political

- Congress' Adivaasi Adhikaar yatra ( BJP took out Parallel ***Dhokha Yatra*** on Social Media ).
- RSS organising Secretary Shivshekhar Rao calls those hankering for post despite being three time legislators / office bearers as " Nalayak" (worthless)- a hint to Shivraj ? Or frustration at inability to accomodate seniors due to inroads by Congressmen ;
- Another poaching of Diggy supporters in his own backyard ; Singh hits back by making BJP leaders cross over.
- After Icons -BJP now targets events- Dandi March besides co-opting lesser known freedom fighters to neutralise Congress'

**Our take** - Cong sticks to its pitch of “ ***Gaddar*** ” ( Traitors ) & “ ***Nalayak*** ” ( worthless) BJP on its narrative of “ ***Bhrasht*** ” (Corrupt ) and “ ***Bantadhar*** ” wrecker )

### Grey

- Vindictive politics: Israeli horticultural project put on hold in Chhindwara to deny mileage to Kamalnath; Raids / Jail of Computer Baba ; 5 cr -Fine on Patwari's relative of Murrām digging; Selective razing of unauthorized properties of Congressmen.
- Medical College sanctioned in Vijay Laxmi Sadho's constituency put on hold- no budget allocation.

**Our take** - Majoritarian approach – winner takes all- does not augur well for the future.

- Double engine Sarkar became a liability in downhill –have to bear the brunt of one more engine.

**Our take** - The state government could not go operate independently of other BJP / Union govt.- in everything the likely impact on other BJP govts. had to be factored in irrespective of the merit of the proposal.

Dark :

- All government action- anti encroachment drive, lockdowns etc-targeting minority ;
- Not allowing the Women's commission to function ( Congress had allowed the appointees of Shivraj government to continue ).

**Our take** – Leaving no space for apolitical is a recipe for hatred and animus.

**Overall** : Myth about Congress lusting for power turned on its head by recent events which conclusively prove that it is the BJP now which cannot stay out of office... Changing politics by peddling *Dharmik* as *Sanskritik* and *Rajnaitik* as *Samajik*... A new template for state politics : Congress Yukt BJP and Hindutva yukta Congress makes it a Hobson's choice for citizens

**Electoral**

Positive

Election Commission conducting 28 by polls albeit with Covid protocol.

Grey –

- Covid protocol more in flouting than adherence.
- Populism and blackmail : Placating Government employees and pensioners by giving their D.A. - in the light of forthcoming Local Bodies elections -Comforting the comfortable in this Covid period is a crime.

**Our take** –

- **FATHER OF BY POLLS** : Arguably the toughest ever set of by elections in the country - prime reason being that they were not merely for numbers but for saving / forming the government of a big state. Maximum misuse of govt. machinery Results meant that Scindia camp was vindicated ; Shivraj maintained status quo ; as did Kamlanath and Diggi ; Losers - Arun Yadav( Reduction in margin of Khandwa a sign ), Brajendra Rathore's son ( Brajendra could win even independently - his son falters.; Messages : sympathy vote works only if the inheritor had

been sympathetic ; Dynastic stuff is no longer ignored ; NOTA -third highest vote signal people do not appreciate imported candidates but are helpless in the face of go vernmrntinPower – esp. du ring a by election Verdict - Electoral victory for BJP , Political victory for Congress ( reverse of 2018poll ).

- Populism and blackmail : in the light of forthcoming Local Bodies elections.-Comforting the comfortable in this Covid period is a crime.

#### Dark -

- No eyebrows raised on declared assets of candidates rising on an average of 50% ( Aidal Singh Kansana's by nearly 500% ) from Nov. 2018 to Sept 2020
- Damoh by election .

#### **Our take –**

- New **(Ab)Normal**-Politics as the biggest investment.
- Damoh by election may have been underwhelming - being a one off case – but the heavy price paid especially by Congress in two of its leaders- Brajendra Rathore ( Mla and Ex- minister ) and Mandvi Chouhan ( District women Committee chief,Bhopal ) lost their lives to Corona ; besides 70 others got infected.

#### Dirty

- Delaying – to place it along Bihar elections , changing delimitation, flouting Covid norms , changing format (Direct elction: Mayor : Indirect : Municipal council :Adhoc) .gerrymandering : to the extent of upside down..
- *Panchayat* elections .
- Local Bodies' election.

#### **Our take –**

- By Hook or by crook- Gerrymandering - to the extent of turning the model upside down.

- A template for election to be won by any means : no ideology , no opportunity to provide sincere workers a platform to communicate policies of the government , to present report cards : made into a war -all is fair approach .
- Use of state machinery , money and muscle power to win over members even after declaration of results.

**Overall** : Covid28 left no space for apolitical ; Independents shrunk and scope for a third party reduced more like. The polity became **Regresssive**- citizens were converted from **Voter to Praja** and Parties behaved like gangs.For **people** - particularly of the region-the bypoll results have meant getting disenfranchised . The aim was to uplift them from voters to citizens ; instead ,they regressed from voters to **Praja**. Exemplified by Jyotiraditya saying to villagers- “ You do not have to vote for BJP or Congress”... You have to vote for me...Go and tell everyone that you have to vote for **Maharaja** Scindia .”

### **ELECTIONEERING**

#### Positive

- BJP : *Nagaroday & Gramoday* Missions- Announcements worth 30 k crores made... Propose to spend over 70 thousand crores in five years .
- BJP : Crisis management plans along with all Master plans .
- Cong. - Brings out its Ghosna Patra / manifesto in these areas - a first for by elections
- Cong : Took lead in announcing candidates

#### **Our take -**

- Window dressing -Announcements were mostly compiling central schemes with a bit of touches- by the way of State’s contribution - adding 3300 cr for the entire state. Figures don’t match - with 50 k deficit budget -how to spend 70 k in five years. Moreover , with less than three years left for this term , any proposal for next five years is legitimate / ethical only with opposition on board .The strange part is that subsequent establishments present proposals for the future without submitting the report card of current term. On the darker side , it



could be seen as an attempt to provide contracts to party workers by giving tenders before election date announced.

- When Planning board has been made subservient to the school of governance – it implies that planning is considered important for smaller bodies but not for state /nation. Convoluted logic. Basic idea is to cloud transparency and dodge accountability.

#### Grey –

- Vishnoi talking about separate Mahkaushal , Narayan Tripathi about Vindhya Pradesh –Sub regionalism..
- Govt. withdrawing all Political cases of BJP workers.
- Panchayati delimitation done in Kamalnath regime allowed to lapse - elections on previous shivraj regime ?
- Kamalnath saying he will get a "real" Lok Ayukta .
- Shivraj announcing CM rise schools even more than one per block.

#### **Our take -**

- The demand for reverting to smaller states is blackmail politics.
- Withdrawing even criminal cases of supporters is politicization of law & order.
- Gerrymandering.
- Inappropriate timing to stokes controversy.
- Chauhan going against his own rule about CM rise schools.

#### Dark -

- Ex- Khandwa Mla /of Cong joins BJP at the last minute.
- Accusations of Money distribution.
- Key Issue of OBC reservation made apolitical football

#### **Our take**

- High time instant entry into parties too banned - no entry after declaration of dates.

- Time to stop Pay TM / UPI transactions too at the last moment (Internet banking may continue) ... Also to block WhatsApp after offline campaigning ends (Email May continue)
- Casteism bound to increase in the same ratio as the rise in communal politics.
- SC stays OBC reservation in Panchayat polls ; HC Stays indefinitely the issue of OBC reservation.

### **Impact on Parties leaders & Citizens**

- Parties built a base of Panchayat and local bodies' elections for VS2023. : Congress revived its cadre ; BJP rejuvenated its workers.
- Parties finetuned their approach for 2023 base on by elections and Panayat / Local bodies polls.-Congress appeared to be on the right track , wake up call for BJP.
- For Gen Next of both parties ,it'll was a litmus test – sub par performance of youth of both parties.
- For Citizens - first true test of expressing themselves on Govt change and Covid performance...Gave a hint about a very close fight in VS 23 and regional parties (AAP included) sure to make foray.
- Shivraj. - – Back to *Ghoshnaveer* mould. –Promises without detailing.Only need to satisfy Modi - not local press , hard interviews ; Double Engine ( Modi –Shivraj ) does help a bit on a case to case basis...Substantial loss in Local bodies led to murmurs against him ..Rumours of CM change became pastime for local media.. – Appears that he only needs to satisfy Modi ; keep party workers in good humour and manage media; The real needs and priorities are skewed- no interactive engagement with local press , no hard interviews; no meaningful association with the opposition and citizens. Dream Projects - Global Skills Park & Narmada expressway ; Budhni gets projects / announcements worth 11K cr : disproportionate.

### **Our take :**

- Global skillpark will produce low skilled labour/ workers for others ...Must have at least 6.25% Local capacity building : Narmada shouldn't cross parikrama path , leisure trail .

- Kamal –– Engaging dark stuff again- in inducting Babulal Chourasia – *Godse* Bhakt.; Nath criticises the delay in repealing Farm laws.
- Diggy : Playing the troubleshooter by working at the grassroots –esp. among farmers ...away from mainstream media... In charge of Movements.

### **Our take-**

- Only “pure/ non-transactional ” (like MK Gandhi) have the moral license to engage with the dark/dirty directly...voices against the duo subdued due to better than expected performance and Kamal giving up LOP.
- Jyotiraditya- got nowhere near the same freehand as he used to get in Congress ... Also his acolytes lost in Gwalior , even in his own ward..Sure signs of Sabotage ..Discontent brewing in his pack. Dream project - Chambal expressway.
- VD Sharma: Local Bodies’ election was First pan state test of – he lost the chance to be a CM contender as substantial percentage of his men lost.
- Narottam Mishra : Appointed the spokesperson of Government – effectively Narration management – beyond headline management.
- Uma Bharti : Though she has announced a break from electoral politics till 2024 , she made her presence felt during by elections.–Prithvipur victory is largely due to her Remains in blow hot blow cold mode: For prohibition , against bureaucracy manipulating governance; Praising successful vaccination drive by Shivraj...
- Pralhad Patel : tried his luck to become active in state politics during Damoh by – election but was singed by his own partymen as BJP could not win even his own ward.
- Mukesh Nayak - too tried get their pound of flesh : to circumvent his marginalization - thru his brother’s entry into BJP.
- Gopal Bhargava -Insinuating Brajendra Rathore as "Asur " ;

**Our take** - The CM and entire Cabinet perpetually in election mode- even for a single inconsequential by election- means that only small , short term stuff gets

done ; long term reforms are forced by a crisis and long term change never gets done ( that is done by leaders who forget the electoral calculus the next day after results till the final year of the term/ before model code of conduct.

\*\*\*

## CAMPAIGN

### **Strategy**

- Cong -
- Giving tickets to youth .
- Fielding some sitting Mla's in key constituencies ;
- Retracing 30K families of Independence movement fighters;
- Taking Out *Sharab Bandi yatra* ( Also taking a dig at Uma Bharti's diluted stand on it)

### BJP

- Tickets to youth ;
- No tickets to sitting Mla's
- Making Bi g ticket announcements at all places .
- Making six times Budget allotment for Local Bodies in the election year.
- last minute completion of municipal works .
- *MainBhi Shivraj*- Flopped

### Tactics

Cong – *Khuddar v/s Gaddar*

BJP- Initiating crossovers

### AGENDA

Cong - Fulfilling the remaining promises of manifesto.

BJP- Drafting 5 yr roadmap for all Municipal bodies.

### ISSUES-

Cong –Covid Mismanagement.

BJP - Name changing of places.

## Slogans

*ShivJyoti express Jitayegi.-Ineffective.*

\*\*\*

### **2023 elections**

- CONG :
- Total command with the state unit.
- Data based approach ..Surveys to decide ticket.
- Manifesto to be ready by Aug 6 ( 5 guarantees announced beforehand)
- 5 guarantees ( Old Pension , 1500 pm Naari Samman , Gas cylinder in 500/- ; .. Besides Farmers' Loan waiver ..)
- Senior leaders based approach. (differentiated viz. 66 losing seats given to Diggi , rest divided between other seniors)
- Aaropatra : 275 ghotalas (biggest scam downplayed : Covid scam ?)
- Arun Yadav says many BJP leaders in contact : Pitching himself in the forefront ? Comment on Modi's father too a strategy
- Target of 150 plus seats.
- Membership Drive - target 50 L ;
- Cong jan jagran Yatra ;
- Ghar vapsi Abhiyan/ ghar chalo : Ajay Singh ;
- Congress to focus on dominating social media narrative in Madhya Pradesh
- trying to improve and check the outflow of people by making coordination committees to Dist heads and mlas in all districts.;
- Tried hanuman CHalisa recitation – in response to Maharashtra developments – got some response ; emboldened after its success in Karnataka
- intitating ladki hoon lad sakti Hoon campaign in M.P .- little or no response ; converted to Naari Shakti.

- Next Gen strategy : perhaps insidiously Jaivardhan is attacking Scindia constituency and vote bank / Marathas ; nakul nath scapping at Shivraj consituency and vote bank/ women ) :
- Slogans : *Maaif karo Shivraaj ,Janta hai Naraaz.*
- Keeping VS & LS intertwined : Appointing 29 Observers –one for each LS seat.
- Priyanka Gandhi coming for rallis- Jabalpur ,Gwalior : basically trying to project her as federal head and Rahul as National head.OTT & Super APP.

### BJP :

- Absolute con troll in the hands of Central body.
- Committee based decentralized approach.
- Appoints Bhupendra Yadav and Ashwini Vaishnav as State Observers : .
- BJP forms a 36 member Poll panel for Panchayat Elections ( Complementary approach to Congress' decentralised )
- Tried to send its workers to 65 K booths in 1000 hrs. over 10 days ( A dry run for 2023 ?) failed
- Tried jan Vikas yatra : failed...Was violently opposed at places.
- BJP calling COngress "leaders" as "dealers" :trying to make the “corrupt “labelstick any which way.
- Launches "Sangathan APP " - to digitise every booth (once again RSS lab though Utrakhand had done earlier ) booth outreach digital ;
- Launches “ Digital Hindu campaign from Bhopal : Kapil Mishra (Delhi Unit –Ex AAp) in charge.
- Aims at 10% raise in vote share -at least 15 L votes more in 2023 .
- Target of 200 seats and over 50 pc votes
- MahaShivraj strategy : Scindia attacking Diggy constituency and vote bank/thakurs while Shivraj hitting at Kamalnath consituency and vote bank/ Tribals... Bid to not only attack Nath / Diggy's cons ti tuency but also their vote base esp. tribals - PEsa, apka rashan apk dwar - first right on treasury is of tribals

- If strategy would be decided by poll panel headed by Tomar ,ticket given by Delhi , Manifesto drafted by Shivraj's *bête noire* Malaiyya...What will Chouhan do ?..From Lt. Governor to [Lieutenant](#)
- Slogans : *Corruption Nath & Bantadhaar*
- Focus On LS : Modi as the face for both VS & LS.

**Our take** : BJP data mining - by reinforcing beneficiaries.

### Legislative

#### Positive

- One day reserved for first timer Mlas .
- Sanitising the vocabulary of legislature.
- Banning gaming apps proposed :
- Uniform Civil Code being drafted at State level.
- Making the law for adulteration stricter

#### **Our take** :

- There ought to one day reserved for CM too- to answer all questions. ( Beyond merely CM hour proposed by Nath- UK Parliament has a Weekly PM Hour ).
- Merely procedural , symbolic , A semblance of sanity restored...
- Throwing baby with bath water -Vet them , build your own games ; have gaming contests etc;. Differentiate between skill based games and chance sports.

#### Grey :

- Religious Independence Bill;
- Governor's address disturbed by Congress .
- Denying the Deputy speaker's post to Congress.
- Law on fines upon protestors who damage property .
- A VS session- shortened : basis no discussion on Post covid vision , Covid document VS Session -Should've been extended instead of curtailed on account of lost days / session due to Covid.

#### **Our take** -

- Provocative bill-when secularism is already enshrined in the Preamble.

- Conventions - about maintaining the decorum - should be adhered to incl. during Governor's address.
- At the level of states , it ought to be "common civil code"- and remain in the Directive principles..
- Simultaneously there ought to be a law on lynch mobs ;

### Economy

#### Positive

- More people- over 40 lakh - began investing in stocks /Mutual funds- better eco literacy
- Setting up of export promotion council .
- GDP of every District will be measured independently by Rajya Neeti Aayog ;
- Indian Economics Union coming up with an "M.P. Model" .
- Shivraj constitutes a Committee comprising bureaucrats ; experts to suggest a roadmap for Enhancing income .
- One district one product scheme

**Our take** Per capita too should be individually measured for each district.

#### Grey :

- 100% FDI without govt .Permission .
- Misleading data : With only 2% share of GST the per capita income grows 67% in 5 yrswhile maharahstra with 14% contription p er gacoita grows at 33 %- yest per capita of mah remains double that o f M.P. ;
- Misleading Promises : 1 trillion dollar economy by 2025(later revised to 550 million) ; doubling farmers' income , housing , tap water for all- by 2022
- Over 36 k borrowed from mkt. and invested in corporations in the past decade ; 2.4 K in interest on 476 cr earning /CAG
- Allowing big investors to take loans against land allotted by government

#### **Our take:**

- Phantom Money embedding in M.P.



- Fact : GST collection of M.P( around 3 k cr.) is lower than most BIMARU states : less than Rajasthan , nearly one third of UP ...Only higher than Bihar
- Fact : If GOI target is 5 trillion and Mah rashtra ,Tamil Nadu ,U.P, K arnataka and even Odisha have all declared a target of 1 trillion each...Where does M.P's 1 trillion fit in ? - It adds upto more than 5 trillion ..On what basis : Size o f economy , growth rate , FDI or what ?..That's why later reduced to 550 million..Housing ,Tap water for all though made substantial p rogress but nowhere near the target...As for farmers -their income has actually decreased.
- Time to redesign the model - borrowing from mkt makes sense only if you can earn more than the mkt.(and/ or give p roportionately more jobs than the m arket)
- Loans against subsidized land allotted for a specific purpose is Resource colonization: ..Having both loans as well as subsidy.

### Dark

- Over 5 K decrease in Per capita Income ;
- Suicides of business men during Covid increase - higher than the National average .
- Idea of 2-3 L yearly package to 32 L youth floated ; 92 Kcr - 38% of the Budget.
- Eco .Crime- U.S embassy contacts Bhind SP for ganja Smuggling via Amazon.

### **Overall**

In allowing the twin tools of Economy capture in this century :Resource colonization ( Land , mines, water , forests etc) and data mining (Virtual colonization) ... M.P. is on the road to becoming an internal Colony (After Jharkhand )

### **Budget**

### Positive

- Soliciting suggestions for Budget from people - must make it meaningful too by analysing .
- Inputs from the outcome a seminar in MP Budget
- Gender allocation - Mahila Thana .
- Major Solar Power projects -future ready for energy ;
- Proposal for opening Unity Malls for one distict one product items of each district,

## Grey -

- *Atmanirbhar* .
- Reduction of duty on farm implements-1% - could save upto 2.5 L for some farmers.
- Once again MP among the poorest states in national poverty data - even among the Bimaru states it is second - so all the exercise merely relative status quo :
- Only making a provision of 1000/- for promises of crores

**Our take;** *Atmanirbhar* without matching *Swavlamban* ( self- reliance sans empowerment) basically means privatization . Tokenisms will only go so far in addressing agri crisis.

## Governance

### Positive/ Cabinet :

- Ethanol policy cleared ;
- Jan Sunvai begins again ;
- New Cooperative policy .
- Backlog of S C/ST Jobs clearing process intited ;
- Jumps upon Gati Shakti.;
- Further enhancement of Ladli Laksmi - a legacy issue for Shivraj-into Laadli Behna :
- Shivraj's Ministers preparing their Report cards ;
- Appointments to corporations/ boards.
- Go vt announces pay of daily wages at par with regulars ; raises the limit of 20 pc absorption in regulars to 50 pc
- Creating a Planning -cum -Policy Commission.;
- Covid cabinet with specific responsibilities to ministers.
- Awarded 2nd in Governance among group B States.
- First state to come up with a 3 yr . **Atmanirbhar Roadmap**.

Developing MSMS corridors alongwith Chambal and Narmada expressways ;100% domestic water connections ; Setting up green energy corridor ; Converting 10 K SHC's and 1200PHC's into health wellness centres ;10 K schools with all basic facilities; Task force for setting up of Agriculture guarantee fund)

- Good governance and Development report.( Preparing Indices .Projecting indices for Amrut period ; Capacity building omission)

**Our take :**

- Purely transaction- even losers - those MLA's who resigned as also lost by elections –too appointed
- " B' metaphorically stands for Bimaru.
- Atmnirbhar (self –reliant) for development *Paraspar nirbhar* (Mutually reliant)
- Good governance report should be complemented with Vision and delivery document prepared during Kamlnath Government.

Grey

- Cabinet withdraws own ordinance about Panchayat Polls.
- Restoring the financial rights of Ex- Pradhans and making them heads of Crisis Mgmt commiteees:
- A survey puts Revenue , Panchayt and Urban admn as most corrupt .
- Making a Football of Anand Vibhag –Kicking around- From Dharmasya to Adhyatma back to Dharmasya - former for babas , latter for Gurus
- Not giving credit to Kamalnath for the decision of free Covid treatment of BPL.
- CM with citizens of state from Delhi Anytime anywhere governance
- Swarojgar Yojana – Keep flipping figure - loans for self employment...Later Seekho –Kamao yojana ( Paid apprenticeship )
- Dabang Governance - Bulldozer Raj . Releasing Encroached land -

**Our take :** Politicising Governance - Both apolitical and non-political citizens' aspects annulled ; Why Policy decision at the last moment : Gujarat Model ?

- Misleading –Many other deptts more corrupt . Perception about these deptts due to public dealing.
- Ought to be "DHARMATMA " ..without Indices GDH is like GDP without P er capita - The gap between happy and Unhappy may widen

- Need *Malaang* Governance..Fair to All.. Selective targeted Bulldozing is for bullheaded .

Dark -

Ungoverned –\_The Scindia faction is at best “ virtually/notionally governed ” by the CM.

Self governed- Gopal Bhargava ,Vijay Shah , Kamal Patel ( They’ve snatched posts in the cabinet by own dint- hence refuse to be governed beyond lip service)

Not governed – BJP party workers ,RSS. (rules are not applicable to them)

Ruled - Citizens .

**Our take** –As has been exhibited umpteen times – more so during Covid-all rules ,pronouncements and compliance is for citizens ...Governing class is not self-governed ....If successful “Specialised cabinet ” of Independent ministers must become a norm.

### Admn

Positive –

- Review of districts after categorizing them into A / B / C.
- Cyber Tehsil formed.
- Auto clearance of files with Time Linit (TL )

\*\*\*

Grey

- Transferring Collector/ SP of Damoh immediately post defeat.
- Order to raise sale of liquor withdrawn: U-turn
- Mandatory VRS scheme .
- Removing Section 17 of Prevention of Corruption Act against Officers.- requiring prior approval

Dark:

- Directing to honour /offer ritual prayers to girls before daily work in offices.

- OSD to CM -resigns post model code of conduct - in order to campaign and comes back again immediately after results- pseudo spoils system ;
- M.P. only state to withhold Promotions of 1 L employees over OBC for past 5 yrs. ; Staff threatens of FIR at CM helpline.

### **Our take –**

- Keeping the lower employees in good humour and making the seniors committed. ...If successful , categorized administration of specific matters must become a norm.
- Shocking transfer of Collector -SP immediately post Damoh defeat- clear signal to all others to become committed ideologically or face the music.
- Club prior approval under Section 17 of with mandatory VRS.
- Travesty- either saving his skin or can't the CM do without OSD even in bypolls.-similar thing happened before 2018

### **ASPECTWISE;**

#### **Health –**

##### Positive-

- Successful Covid vaccination. Drive.
- Medical devices Unit(s) –Park at Ujjain ;
- Quantum increase in Health funding.

##### Grey

- Poor Covid management
- 10 k hospitals / PHCs' updated but no staff incl. pharmacists.paramedics.
- Dengue cases mishandling 10 K cases ;
- Data- disturbing that even now 56pc of state is at the mercy of private health care.(ought to be in the ratio of poverty ; besides PHI )

##### Dark :

- Massive understatement- fudging- of Covid deaths.
- MP slides even further in national Ranking - to 16th place

- Still at the bottom in IMR - at par with Sudan, Kerala on par with U.S
- M.P. still has maximum neo natal deaths.

**Our take** : With Both ASER & IMR at the bottom -what of the future generation?

## Home

### Positive-

- Police commissioner system introduced.

**Our take** : Bring social policing alongwith: every change must accompany reform :punitive- cum preventive

### Grey

- One Policeman over 1080 persons in M.P. as against the national average of 649 ;

**Our take** : A backward state like M.P should have higher no. of policemen than national average- as security is a prime concern.

### Dark :

- M.P. in top three in crime against Juveniles / children .
- In top three states for Crime against women.
- Maximum crimes against senior citizens.
- 2nd Highest no. of illegal arms unearthed ( after U.P ).
- Child Porn In Dabra - for internet.
- Multiple cyber attack on the system - incl. hacking MP Online .
- Most Dark Apps from MP -Both Bulli Bai and Sulli apps had MP connection :

### Dirty

- M.P.L eads in involvement of children in crime ;
- 7 K tribal girls missing

**Our take** –

- Overall highest crime rate esp. against women ,children and old - markers of a backward state. More than the high number of rapes , it is the increased incidents of gang rape that is alarming.

## Agriculture

### Positive

- 6 K per year to farmers with matching 6k by central govt. –average comes to 1k per month.
- Superseeder introduced.
- Modernising initiatives for Mandis.
- MP now Biggest producer of Oranges , Guava;
- Mission Mode for Agri export ;
- M ega irrigation scemes - using pressurised pipe method (supplying waters to farms via underground pipes) viz. Mohanpura

### Grey

- Organic farming promoted without backing incentives and/ or subsidies.
- Govt saddled with over 1 cr tonne of excess wheat during Covid.
- Allowing private traders to procure - the same team which gave *Bhavantar* scheme designed it.; Precursor / Trial ballon for central farm bills designed to exacerbate it ..”

### Dark :

- M.P. one among 4 states where farmers’income declined in p ast couple of years ( from 9K to 8.4 K)
- 69 Mandis shut shop after new farm laws
- Fertiliser crisis ; Farmers esp. in backward districts taking loans for farming;
- Govt says it has no data on Farmers income in VS
- Kamal Patel says that they’ll bring back the three farm laws .

### Dirty

- 5% Increase in farmer suicides in Covid ; highest Numbet of farmer suicides 35 K in M.P. during Covid ;
- Scams ; Agri Soil testing Kits scam ; *Bardaana* (Crop bag ) scam; Scam in Agri payments : 25L farmers Online But only 17 L turn up offline.

- 15 cr a day interest on 45K cr loan for storing/ procuring agriproduce -25% in Open ;

### **Our take –**

- Farming output improved but farmers suffered .
- Remunerative prices nor loan waiver .
- Brokers being streamlined- online ?
- Allowing private Mandis opened the possibility of hoarding in the crisis period - a Bhavantar kind of scheme – designed to benefit traders more than the farmers.
- Like everything MP could be a lab for farm laws too-pilot pvt. Mandis too were tested first in the state/ Mandsaur.

### **Industry-**

#### Positive

- Setting clusters of Furniture , toys -China like .
- 16 Industries proposed in Naxal affected Balaghat
- Mriganayani products on Amazon
- CM Udyog Kranti Yojana
- CM promises to make Indore the start up capital .
- Proposed Defence corridor in Gwl – Chambal :

#### Grey

- Over 1 lakh GST Business licences in M. P. cancelled due to turnover and taxes Not mat ching ;
- Industrial areas to be developed in 21k acres our take- all in North western M.P .
- Industries allowed to sell land allotted for Industries.
- Holding Global Investors’ meet.
- Licences for industries to be renewed only after 10 yrs
- Sakhlecha to lay the foundation stone of 2500 MSME simultaneously in Jan 2021
- Minister slightly parochial –drags many units to his region:Neemuch-Mandsaur.
- Mostly working on actualising the MOU’s signed by Kamalnath with Big industry

### **Our take**



- Need matching ecosystem for clusters to be competitive.
- Check out resource colonisation- whether single conglomerate , foreign companies etc. monopolizing.
- Industry minister (Sakhlecha) is industrious. However , he needs to be innovative too.
- On the lines of Farmers loan- will only help in security not welfare ;
- Most proposed clusters in West & North ...Have matching clusters , factories in the east .

## **Transport**

### Positive

- National Vision Zero Summit on Traffic Safety organised to understand the responsibility of road safety and reach the vision.
- State and central transport ministries organise a meet to improve Traffic via drone
- MOR ( maintenance-Operation- repair ) – of aircraft ( training school at Khajuraho)
- Air Cargo hub(Bhopal)

### Grey

- Misleading reports about biggest airport in India between Bhopal and Dewas
- M.P leads in rural roads network expansion

### **Our take :**

- Mobility survey is a must along with transport vision. Both must be done by different agencies.
- Must become leaders in Drone usage for public works.
- Many rural roads superfluous while many key urban roads unkempt.

## **Education**

### Positive

- Focus on research -
- Introducing drama , fiction- in English texts .
- Placement and counseling officers

- Group insurance for teachers

### **Our take :** .

#### Grey-

- Bharat Shikshan Mandal-At the forefront of implementing NEP -4 yr course ;
- Govt . spent 47 k per student (overall 42 k cr ) - more than convent schools yet poor outcomes :
- Symbolisms : *Kulpati* as *Kulguru* .
- Medical Ethics : Hegdewar , Deendayal Upadyaya in Syllabus .
- Ramcharitamanas as optional subject in schools , colleges.
- Medical edu. in Hindi .

#### Dark :

- 39 more Pvt. Univs in pipeline despite student numbers declining in the existing Universities... If materialised, MP will have the highest no. of pvt. Univs in the country ( Currently it is second after Gujarat)
- University elections revival mooted.
- Only 11.5 % govt. schools have internet , 3% have computers ...Digital divide.

### **Our take-**

- Bharat Shikshan Mandal RSS controlled.
- Govt . spent disproportionately more on infra than teachers.
- Do not repeat past mistakes – will not find students ; begin with Indian medical systems first ;
- What about Moral teaching along with Ethics viz.- Gandhi's teachings.
- Universities should prepare students for next 30 yrs.lifelong learning... If in a poor state Pvt . Univs grossly outnumber public ones , the quality of students will suffer.
- The minister ( Mohan Yadav ) is reluctant .Everybody in BJP knows that education and culture are outsourced to RSS and there is nothing much for the minister to do on his own.Accordingly,he is trying to be on the forefront of implementing NEP. Directing Education department to

engage with RSS body- Bharat Shikshan Mandal- in all the interactions of New Education Policy.

- Allowing anymore new universities will kill existing public Universities.
- Religious education , if at all, ought to be all encompassing viz. teach gist of all religions ..possibly different versions of holy texts –eg Valmiki Ramayana and Ramcharitmanas both....Teaching Ramcharitmanas for Hindi and only teaching Ghazals for Urdu is discriminatory.

## **Mining**

### Positive-

- Fast tracking diamond mining in Chhattarpur.
- To have twin admn of Mining deptt. - One IAS for gen. admn. and another tech. director (will benefit all aspects of mining- from survey to monitoring )

### Grey-

- Dolomite mining in Mandla under cloud
- Biggest Sand Mining lease Hoshangabad cancelled -
- Small mining promoted in major way.
- Granting rights of sanction of minor minerals to Ministers incharge.
- The New Central Mining law amendments. have put the state governments – esp. those of mining rich states- at a disadvantage...

**Our take** – Granting Minor mineral’ mining sanctioning power is decentralizing corruption ; meanwhile the big sand mafia operates brazenly .

- The New Central Mining law amendments. have put the state governments – esp. those of mining rich states- at a disadvantage.

### Dark

- The mining Companies in Gwalior Chambal and some other zones file an application for withdrawing their contract in the face of violent illegal miners. Their patrons like BSP Mla says the companies are themselves involved and are looking for an excuse to dishonour contracts. Since a

whole lot of contracts were given by Kamalnath government and legal mining stopped during Covid whereby illegal activity flourished.

- Messed up policy framework.- multiple flip flops and adhocism

### Dirty

- Tendering for Gold ,Diamond and Vanadium blocks leasing for 50 yrs- three months before elections

**Our take** – The New Central Mining law amendments have put the state governments – esp. those of mining rich states- at a disadvantage. It must be contested. Mandla mining should be only on temporary lease-being in the national park buffer zone and mining mafia should be reconciled with mining lobby.( No government of a poor state can abolish them ).

### **Excise**

#### Positive-

- Allocating contracts by raising 10% of the fee.
- Heritage wines introduced- Mahua based production aimed to fetch 300 cr revenue and thousands of Jobs .

#### Grey -

- Allowed bottling in 90 ml bottles.
- Flipping the liquor policy multiple times in three years

#### Dark

- Coming up with composite shops or Foreign and Indian Liquor.
- Loss of over a hundred lives due to spurious liquor-esp. during Covid.

### **Our take-**

- Basically cheating people- raising 10% fee and reducing 10% content to consumers - most of whom won't notice.
- 1000 cr loss to the exchequer due to composite shops – contractors gain as shops doubled without actually giving twice the licence fee .
- Liquor mafia ran riot during Covid.

### **Urban development**

### Positive-

- Cities of MP top in Municipal Administration Index too.
- Maximum M.P cities in list of clean cities :
- Workshop on “ Reinventing urban governance on Indian cities” held .
- 7 years R.I. on colonisers usurping park lands

### Grey -

- Madhya Pradesh bags 3 SKOCH Awards for successful implementation of urban development schemes and municipal governance The Silver SKOCH award -2023 has been awarded to Sagar Smart City for building She-Lounge women’s facility, Madhya Pradesh Urban Development Company for better management of Dharmapuri Sewage Project and Urban Development and Housing Department for remarkable work in Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana Urban
- Allocation of 3k cr for Local bodies in Budget
- Proposing 30 PC compounding of illegal construction( later retraced to 10 pc)
- No input for incorporating massive changes in urbanisation due to Covid experience.

### Dark -

- Smart city projects completely opaque
- Land in name of a smart city ,metro ..all under central control UT’s,
- Resource colonization : Prime land blocks transferred to sparsely funded central control UT’s,
- AMRUT municipal corp:decentralisation of funds ,centralization of functions/tasks...reverse of 72<sup>nd</sup> Amendment.

**Our take-**Unless there is matching citizen inclusion and participation in Urban governance , there would be clean cities with maximum **dark** activities.

### **Sports**

#### Positive-

- Shooters bring laurels.

- Traditional activities- Malkhamb- included in sports.
- Hosting Khelo India
- Initiating E- sports & Break Dance academy.

#### Grey-

- Small Khelo centres to be established in most districts.
- Bhopal Hosting Junior Nationals of hockey too .

#### **Our take-**

- While sports infrastructure has become good , results – esp. by locals – are not commensurate
- Pitching for organising “ Khelo India ” doesn’t make sense – it is logical only when M.P. can emerge as the podium state.( without imported sportsmen from other states into our academies ).
- M.P. sports deptt. Emerging as an event manager rather than promoter/ facilitator of sports.

#### **Youth welfare**

##### Positive

- The income limit of scholarships for SC students raised to 8 lakhs.
- State youth Advisory Council constituted with CM heading it. It’ll give inputs for youth policy and related matters.
- By 2026 M.P. would have the third largest youth work force- hence higher growth projected

##### Grey

- Rojgar Mela –
- New Youth Policy

#### **Our take :**

- Unless concomitant human resource quality improved, all steps would amount to running in the same place.

- On employment day CM gave 271 cr. to 1309 MSME's by a single click...With the promise of generating 2.25 lakh jobs
- Two key issues still lie unaddressed - Job creation , and training to increase employability
- Rozgar melas only ensure better delivery- matching jobs to seekers- not the creation of jobs.
- CM has been throwing figures in the wind at whim ; initially he promised to generate 10 L jobs , subsequently promised to generate 1 L Jobs a month and finally has settled on filling the backlog of 1 L govt jobs. That is little over two percent of unemployed youth ( 40 L)
- A policy barely three months before elections means little-electoralising governance.

### **Women and Child development**

#### Positive

- Laadli Behna scheme -supplementary income for the poor women.
- Giving school uniforms tailoring contracts. to **SHG's** .

#### Grey

- Ladli Bahna Senas to be formed in every village :

#### Our take :

- Laadli Behna scheme v/s Nari Samman Yojana : competitive populism.
- Giving govt. contracts to SHG's a welcome step in participatory governance.
- Vigilantes or vote banks at the cost of exchequer ?

### **Rural Development**

#### Positive

- New scheme launched on Deendayal's Anniversary- Mukhyamantri Jan adhikar yojana - for Pattas;
- *Gramoday* scheme launched - for an all round development of villages-in a mission mode.

### Grey-

- Harda becomes the first district to complete all the paperwork for “*Swamitva* scheme ” ( Wherein villagers are given property rights of their houses - for mortgaging against loans )
- *Swamitva* Yojana - M.P. takes lead Congress says it was designed by them
- CM announces Patta to landless / extended families.

### **Our take**

- Careful- do not link with Swamitva more than 50% of land/ property else debt trap.
- Without matching- ***Grameenoday*** ( Empowering villagers ) - It'll not be *Sarvodaya*...Kamal patel in his over enthusiasm may lead the district into a debt trap ...in no case should loan exceeding 50% of eligibility be allowed.

## **Forests / Wildlife**

### Positive-

- World Bank hails conservation of State forests under Green India scheme.
- M.P. emerges top in the number of Vultures, leopards.
- Other states can plant trees in M.P for Carbon credits , Multinationals too can do the same - Can Vikas Nigam will take care of it :

### Grey-

- Forest fires – Betul , Nauradehi and some other places;

### **Our take-**

- Proactive approach lacking.
- Commercial forestation -A game changer for employment too- reserve for ST ,Women/ nurseries , SC's , BPL etc.-

## **Tourism**

### Positive



- Award for best rural tourism.
- Mindful wellness tourism .
- 14 units of MP tourism win awards.

#### Grey-

- Promoting religious tourism.
- Building / upgrading ultra rich temples at Public expense.

#### **Our take –**

- A key area for M.P. , tourism is still nowhere near its potential – both in numbers as also in scale.
- Converting pilgrimge to tourism in the name of religious tourism takes away the sanctity.

### **Energy-**

#### Positive-

- Incremental solarisation.

#### Grey-

- Companies seeking fixed charge .
- Given lease of 35 yrs to Adani for power distribution .

#### Dark

- Continued payment –thousands of crores- to discoms without utilization.

#### **Our take-**

- Fixed charge demand of the companies has meant to back to the racket of previous Shivraj regimes wherein they were paid the contracted amount despite much lower consumption.
- How can the govt . give lease for 35 yrs to anyone ? Without involving opposition
- Permitting theft to retail consumers in the vote banks and allowing dacoity to note banks (moneybags)

### **Water resources**

### Positive-

- Govt. of M.P gets first position in utilisation , conservation of water ( Irrigation projects , Amrut Sarovars , drip irrigation etc.)
- Special body constituted to ensure optimal utilization of water share in the Narmada treaty by 2024.
- Fishermen given the first right over government lakes and water bodies.

### Grey-

- Ken Betwa Link agreement signed.

### Dark

Gujarat seeks greater share of Narmada water citing greater increase in population and inability of M.P. to utilize its quota.

### **Our take:**

- Like all other previous inter state treaties , Madhya Pradesh **shortchanged** in this one too. The submergence would largely be in Madhya Pradesh ,it is common knowledge going by past experience that the potential for water /irrigation is always overestimated to garner funds ;besides, U.P gets disproportionate share. ;not to speak of the fact that many environmental clearances are still pending...The least that could be bargained is that there should be a 100 yr delinking date - that is , the first link would be decommissioned to allow it to rejuvenate and possibly a new link commissioned from another place - the future linking ought to be reserved now .
- Gujarat demand amounts to resource colonisation..As it is , in the previous agreement too , they had benefitted disproportionately.

## **Environment**

### Positive

- To tackle the problem of climate change people to be associated under Mission LiFE
- Best waste recycling..Indore etc ;

- First carbon credits in the Country (Indore)

#### Grey-

- Most polluted cities too in M.P -
- Sound proof road / corridor in Tiger reserve - : What is the Point?
- Ken- Betwa project being rushed By "easing" Environmental clearances ?

#### Dark

- Satpura- Melghat link ; No NTCA clearance , No Mitigation cost provided.

#### **Our take:**

- How is that happening -a state with cleanest cities also has most polluted ones?
- Melghat will cost 10 Kcr ;4 k cr. of Public money at stake ;
- Environmental clearances being rushed through – often diluted – in the name of ease of business.

### **Cooperatives**

#### Positive

- Released grabbed plots in societies by Mission mode .

#### Grey-

- Precluding societies to sell plots

#### **Our take:**

- Plot to control cooperative societies politically by embedding them-Gujarat Model ?.

### **Social Justice**

#### Positive-

- Nashamukti Abhiyan .

#### Grey-

- Building paid Old age home in Bhopal.

#### **Our take-**

- Neither *SharabBandi* nor *Nashamukti* ( Total Prohibition nor complete de- addiction) is possible. Combo of Awareness , public education cts. Monitoring rehabilitation is the only way.

### **Welfare**

#### Positive

- Panchayat of hand-cart pushers, hawkers , street at CMs residence
- Hosting Lawyers' Panchayat .

#### Grey

- Madhya Pradesh first state in the country to provide air travel for pilgrims

#### **Our take :**

- Building vote banks at state expense ... Why keep it in CM house ?
- Politicising professions... Apolitical way is to deal with their associations ...In Panchyats govt. chooses who to engage with –selectively- not necessarily their elected representatives.
- Air trips for elderly –tokenism

### **Culture.**

#### Positive-

- Frequency of films , web series shooting in M.P increased.
- M .P .wins award for most film friendly state.

#### Grey-

- Disproportionate Ramlilas in tribal areas.
- New film / OTT censorship / vetting policy under fire.
- IIFA cancelled.

- CM lays the foundation stone of the grand Devi Lok in Salkanpur to be built at a cost of Rs 211 crores -worships shilas brought from different villages Sadhus-Sant-Mahants of monasteries, temples, shaktipeeths and akhadas witness event
- Festival of Unity Celebrated in Ujjain - to enhance understanding between states - without inviting opposition: Governor Presiding.
- Diggi calls Bajrang Dal a body of goons

### Dark

- Mahakaal Scam : Many contract files without sign

### **Our take-**

- Ramlila does not need any promotion by department of culture ( *laukik* ). The Job of the department of culture is to “promote” culture and not “impose” it upon others
- Politicising religion....not realizing it is not a picnic spot ... making rich spots richer ... ropeways.
- Telngana establishment day celebrated in Ujjain-later in Hyderabad: Party politics at state expense.
- Polticising the office of governor
- Simhastha scam as yet pending , another scam in the same place.
- NSUI were the original goons , Bajrangis are crooks.

### **Tribal**

### Positive

- PESA ntitated-to be implemented instages.
- Empowerring the village forest committees of tribals , sand free for PM awas.
- Tribal Intiatives : *Aushadhi Padap*- tribal medicine;Ration *Dwar Par* ; Tendupatta sale - by committees :
- Gene coding pilot for sickle cell in marriages etc;

### Grey-

- *Aadivassi Maha Sammellan* - labelling Birsa Munda as “Bhagwan” - that too an Icon from different state- as “Bhagwan” may backfire ;

- To have Ramayan played out in tribal areas- calling them Hindu , Bhagwan etc.
- Renaming *Aadim Kalyan Vibhag* as *Janjatiya Kalyan Mantralaya*.
- detribalisation

### Dark

- Highest number of atrocities against tribal in M.P:

### Dirty

- Atrocities on tribals: Urinating on tribal man in Seedhi. .

### **Our take-**

- PESA -not as instituted by Narasimha rao - but only in minor ways : No matching funds , functions , functionaries.
- May manage to pseudo(detribalized/ Hinduised) adivasi such as Bharias etc; If adivasis fought the British their own kin squealed on tantya Bhil
- Labelling Birsa Munda - too an Icon from different state- as “Bhagwan” may backfire.
- Misleading ; As a percentage of states with 6.25% or more tribal pop it is not highest
- Renaming Aadim Jaatis (Aborigines) as Janjatis ia an attempt is to deny their identity and co-opt them into a Hinduised version of society.
- detribalisation

### Media

#### Positive

- More meaningful and longer discussions on Regional TV Channels.

#### Grey

- Substantial content from International Publications being carried by regional newspapers in translated versions.

**Our take-** Translated content is a double edged sword - if it is a one way thing. Unless there is a content exchange ,it amounts to creating readers for the original foreign publication in future ... Moreover, English Newspaper / sites- closing shop in the state - is a symbol of backwardness

## PR

**Dark** –Sole tender allocation scandal- work over 100 cr done only on paper. .

**Our take-** DPR behaved as Private relations company of Shivraj .

\*\*\*

**Our take** : How did one or two companies get contracts worth over a thousand crores in 15 yrs ? A classic case of dipping from cronyism to Crony gangsterism.

## Legal / Courts

### Positive

- HC Triple test : Political, Eco, so cial Backwardness to be the basis of OBC reservation .
- M.P. HC launches its own OTT platform for live telecast.

### Grey-

- All the controversial cases scuttled : VYAPAM , E-Tendering etc.
- MP is one of the two states without Fast track courts alongwith . Rajasthan (130 odd sanctioned by the Finance commission)
- CJI pulls up Govt of M.P for its cavalier attitude towards cases ; orders Adv gen to present cases

### Dark

- M.P has least number of courts -496 posts vacant -only Bihar has more.

### Our take :

- While the state has special court but neither fast track nor enough *Lok Adalats* nor mediation...Injustice in a poor state is a double whammy.
- Least courts –even lesser judges-means delay : (Justice denied )
- Could've done better in allowing rallies albeit with Covid discipline –shown the videos ; else only those tested in the past 24 hrs should've been allowed

\*\*\*

## VI.

### ADDENDUM :

( 17 yrs. of BJP Rule ;15yrs of Shivraj ; 15 months of Kamalnath ).

Evolution : **SICKLY TO MALNOURISHED** (*BIMARU SE KUPOSHIT*)

Devolution : **FROM DARK TO DIRTY** (*SHYAM SE MALIN* )

( 17 YRS OF BJP RULE )

## Politics

- Evolution : Inclusivity increased.( covering most communities)
- Devolution : Participation decreased.( No involvement of citizens in implementation)

**Overall:** Beyond tokenisms, deformed democracy into a rule “ By the politicians , for the politicians, of the politicians .” : ...Populism , dirty politics combo- all justified in the name of winning elections/ winnability.

## Economy

- Evolution : Diversified ; Higher largely with low inflation .
- Devolution : Per capita income rise slower than GDP growth , greater divide .

**Overall:** From Inspector Raj in earlier regimes to Contractor Shasan now ; complete cronyism prevails in state contracts while lobbies and mafia have a stranglehold in market.; Debt exceeds Budget - Heading for a debt trap ? .

## Media

- Evolution : Quantum growth in media proliferation .
- Devolution : Line between paid news , PR, media and news blurred... public broadcasting obliterated...Social influencers become influentials.

**Overall:** Better production quality but poor content . It has become *Godi* -not necessarily Modi- media : a lapdog of whoever in power .Public Relations at worst and public literacy at best : No public education .If the major profession of the media houses is non- media activities how can independence even be expected ? There's no real regional media ...No Public broadcasting is possible for the lack of a suitable platform. If there is



no transparency about media funding- can there be honesty in its work ?  
There is hardly any journalism left in the face of commercialisation ... Only media remains.

## Education

Evolution : Mushrooming of education facilities

Devolution : Teaching limited to knowledge transfer.

**Overall:** Overemphasis on Learning skills : basically producing cheap labour , craftsmen for state and others ; Lowering Math standards will widen the gap with other states. Capacity development on the backburner.

## Society

- Evolution : Social consciousness on the rise.
- Devolution : Identity politics gives it a twist.

**Overall:** Caste calculus up to *Gotra* level; even same caste people being differentiated on the basis of place of origin...M.P. doesn't have substantial minority population whence polarisation wasn't very effective which is why caste mapping was critical...Post Covid targeted polarization attempts to nullify caste disadvantage in select areas. Only caste Politics countered with Varna politics ..*Jati* for individuals ,*Varna* collectively : termed as *Sammaj* viz. *Sahu Samaaj*.

## Elections

- Evolution : Voters have become discerning- are able to differentiate between VS ,LS and Local bodies elections.
- Devolution : Strategist , PR men , Vote bank managers and constituency brokers have hijacked the process; one-one physical engagement of candidates with voters almost non-existent.

**Overall:** Reduced to a game of money and data with strategists and vote bank managers calling the shots. Preparing vote slaves - by keeping them at the mercy of govt. by small doles- not big enough for them to

become independent. From vote bank / constituencies to vote slaves / vote coolies. Elections the be all and end all of everything .Voting reduced to a farce when elected governments subverted ; elected representatives are not consulted in major issues etc..

**P.S.:** All these are a part of larger national / global trend - only the ills are amplified and positives **subdued** in M.P.

\*\*\*

#### **FROM TRAVELLING GOOD SAMARITAN TO VILLAGE HOPPING BIG BROTHER**

( PAON PAON WAALE BHAIYA SE GAON GAON WALE BHAI SAHAB TAK )

#### **FROM CHEAT MINISTER TO CHEAP MINISTER**

( BAHRUPIYA SE VISHRAJ TAK)

( 17 yrs of Shivraj : PERCEPTIONT V/S REALITY)

Shivraj's modus operandi has always been - jack of all and master of one - across all his terms. In each term he delivered incremental gains in most aspects while transforming one chosen aspect. Alongside, he tried to cultivate one vote bank. Prior to becoming CM , Chauhan's image among commoners was that of " *Paon Paon wale Bhaiya*" ( Pedestrian Brother ) and his partymen knew him as *Bahrupiya* (impersonator) . Subsequently, during each term he cultivated a different specific image in public while acquiring a new epithet among among the close circle .

In first term , he focused on roads while doing the routine stuff in auto mode ; that matched his pre-CM image among rural voters and earned him the title of *Pappu* in the partymen; The general perception was that *Pappu chala*

*Papa banane , thapa ban gaya* (A youth tried to become Dad but ended up as baby sitter instead ).

Second term saw Chouhan concentrating on electricity while making a hue and cry about incremental gains . That brought over the rurban voter to him and extended his image to “Bhai Saab” in masses – the partymen thought of him as *Yeda ; Usne yeda bankar peda khaya* ( Enjoyed the fruits while pretending simplicity )...Ultimately he runs the risk of being a *leda* (garbage), it was conjectured.

The third term saw *Shivraj* keyed on irrigation and went into hype mode over series of incremental low hanging stuff . Simultaneously , with a slew of measures for women - incl. budgetary provisions. Resultantly , he created the image of “*Mama*” among half the voters and was given the title of a *Baazigar* ( Juggler) by the coterie ( *Jadugar* –magician-by some in the media and *Kalakaar* –con artist- by opposition politicians)...Overall , the perception was *Karmaveer ki Jagah Ghoshnaveer bane to Bhonpu Chouhan rah gaye* ( Concentrating on pronouncements than action meant ending as a mere megaphone);

In the current term his targets were housing for poor and piped water to all by 2022 ...Only difference is that both are flagship schemes of Central government-There is no Shivraj Scheme. While there has been progress on both targets , they’re still some way off achieving them. Hence , as we head to the last leg and things start slipping Shivraj has begun consolidating his vote banks - by giving supplementary income of 1000/- to women under Laadli Behna scheme , matching Modi’s Kisan Samman with an equal amount from state government etc... besides making attempts to woo the aggrieved constituencies viz. youth facing unemployment by offering earn while you learn apprenticeship scheme (*Seekho Kamao Yojana* ) of 8 K per head ... It seems too little too late and a moniker “*Maamu*” ( Scheming maternal Uncle) is being floated about him... His public claims of being a tiger , at the onset of this term are reflected privately among the core group as a “ Circus Tiger ” towards the end.

In the present innings Shivraj assumed a Presidential Mode – more like a constitutional Royalty. The way he projects himself all over media (Spent crores

on self promotion every year) ; manner in which he buys state planes and uses them like a personal autorickshaw ( even on private religious trips- that too out of state- to Tirupati, Shirdi ) ... This term has brought out the **ruthless trait** of Chouhan in getting rid of three of his blue eyed officers of previous terns .A DG of school of governance , RERA chief and transferring the closest ally (An ACS) five days before retirement.

With roadside gimmicks ( kneeling on stage ,using foul language etc.) Shivraj is more like “Cheap” Minister this time ... With mode with *Neta* , *Neeti* , ideas ,Event ( *Dandi* march) imported from opposition he is more like the first **Congress Yukta CM** of BJP ( Just a Narasimha Rao is considered by some to be the first BJP *Yukta* PM of Congress) ..

His overall journey has been -From *Pappu Yeda* to *Gappu Vishraj* ;From *Paon Paon Wale Bhaiyya* to *Hawa Hawai Bhai ( Sahib)*-one with biggest outreach to a man out of reach ; Shivraj’s latest pronouncements about being a big cat fail to impress the core group - which knows him to be a **House cat**- public too will catch up sooner this time than earlier innings.

In the post Covid scenario Shivarj appears more like a **Vishraj** ( Poisonous King ) than Shivraj ... Gulping poison from the high command and spewing venom a upon his adversaries – both within the party and elsewhere. While raising the bogey of urban naxals , he spawned “ rurban communal”- spreading hatred in the hinterland :, ...

To overcompensate , he is going all out in doling out promises and freebies - from saying that he wishes to see an income of 10K for every woman ...To make up for lack of major works he has initiated two mega expressways ; Ken-Betwa Link ; Global skills park , CM rise schools; mega solar power projects -shots a t “ big” things . Made token attempts to improve governance and make adminstration more efficient .. Good governance report and setting of State statistical service. .. Problem is that many of them are not thought thru ... even hopping from village to village is helping to create an impression of “ **gaon gaon waale Bhai sa’ab**”( **Village Hopping Big Brother**) - When seen thru the matrix of anti-incumbency to the party and counter-incumbency to

himself , it is creating a perception instead of *Gappu Vishraj( Devious Boast ) and Hawa Hawaii Bhai ( Sahib)- a man out of reach*

Cumulatively speaking , across terms , Uptil now , he has **reformed** the state politics – converted it to populist and social security oriented ; transformed the concept of development to almost solely imply physical , material infrastructure ; turbo charged the agrarian economy-Infrastructure enhanced ; delivery improved , social security strengthened ; health , education and sports infrastructure expanded...

Its **flip side** is that Public service and welfare suffered; he could not usher in growth oriented politics ; Cronyism became the norm in economy...While he did a lot of small things in a big way ,Chouhan could not do big things - not a single Big dam , not a single expressway ( two are in the pipeline), not a single big industry besides on virtually all Human development indicators the state slipped.( health , education , sports et al ). If one has to point at the **single biggest failure** , it is the “relative” decline of human resources of the state .(They’ve grown but others/states have grown much faster ). ...

Using the Public property as personal wealth , bureaucracy as private staff , DPR as personal publicist and Police as Private army –of self and party -can only take you so far ; “ best ” among like minded , never “unique”- best across classes.

In the name of reinventing himself , it has actually been the same man in various get ups-*Bahrupiya-* by 2018 the entire Public knew it ( which is why they rejected him , not the party ) .Along the way he has tried to go from *Siyasat* to *Riyasat* to *Virasat* now ( From politics to fiefdom to legacy ).

For hagiographies , the journey may be described as **FROM TRAVELLING GOOD SAMARITAN TO VILLAGE HOPPING BIG BROTHER ( PAON PAON WAALE BHAIYA SE GAON GAON WALE BHAI SAHAB TAK )**; for critics and adversaries ( FROM *BAHRUPIYA* TO *VISHRAJ* -Charlatan to Poison King )... Truth as always is a mix of Both...reality lies somewhere in between. On the way up , positive image gets hyped by force multipliers and value additions ,on the way down ,dark perception trends and becomes viral. Just as in his Pre-CM days , the public image of “*Paon Paon..*” was in sync with private view of *Bahrupiya* (different man to different people / situations) ; in the post CM phase the

Public Image - “*Gaon Gaon Wale ...*” may integrate with Private opinion (*Vishraj* – poison king )... . Cheat minster to cheap minister ...A man who came in twice via the back door-cheating and finishes term with unending cheap gimmicks.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### SHIVRAJ TIMELINE

TERM 1 : *Paon Paon wale Bhaiya” se Bahrupiya ; Pappu chala Papa banane , thapa ban gaya*

TERM 2 : *Bhai Saab se Baazigar; Usne yeda bankar peda khaya, leda rah gaya.*

TERM 3: “ *Mama ” se “Jadugar”;* *Karmaveer ki Jagah Ghoshnaveer bane to Bhonpu Chouhan rah gaye;*

TERM 4: *Gaon Gaon Waale Bhai Sa’ab” se Hawa Hawaii Bhai ( Saheb) ; Gappu se Vishraj*

#### NATH GOVERNMENT-FROM DEDICATED TO QUASI COMMITTED.

**Shashidhar .S. Kapur**

When Kamalnath took over what was he expected to **achieve , resolve** -immediately, in the first 100 days, six months and one year? In the context of the mandate it was to initiate delivery of top priority promises made in the rallies , initiate delivery for the next few in the list of *Vachan patra* (Manifesto) within 100 days and six months besides some low hanging fruits. It was expected that crop loan waiver ( upto two lakhs would be done immediately ) , some sort of unemployment dole for youth within 100 days , some scheme for women in the first six months and upgrading the economy in the first year besides initiating the Vidhan Parishad. On the **corrective** side it was expected that the top scams would be addressed ASAP- Vyapam , Mining and Simhastha ; E – tendering , PDS , tree planting- were to follow suit. Moreover, it was expected that latest by the end of first year , a Vision of government and Policy of every ministry would be in place. Only then an integrated development with a cohesive approach could be hoped.

At the **outset**, after the Vidhan Sabha results , it was thought that history may be repeated in selecting the CM but the history creators of the past were history makers of today. So that didn't happen. Subsequently, it was anticipated that there would be the usual drama for portfolios – that too didn't happen .Finally , last minute trick of contesting the speaker's post by BJP to prevent Congress from playing its role effectively in Vidhan Sabha too boomeranged. The tables were completely turned on it when Congress snatched away even the deputy speaker's position. Opening its innings on front foot, ruling party set the **tone** .

Thus after the first round of sparring, opposition took the hint and changed its strategy. It too adopted what has become the norm these days – the **scorched earth tactic**- lying low and waiting for the government to make mistakes.

True to the expectations , efforts were made from the word go to change the polity than merely changing the politicians– from **politics** of delivery to politics of performance. Meaning executing **more** of whatever was promised and **less** of delivering whatever is demanded : ad hoc -populism. Politics was more **tactical** with both parties in not- lose :not lose stance , given the close mandate .It was a **cold war** at best. Congress tried veering to corporate model than a descendancy / family run enterprise by empowering the regional satraps; BJP attempted quietly to move away from Supremo to Kutumb controlled culture by leadership collectivisation.

It was attempted to bring in change ( *Badlaav*) in **legislation** too albeit oddity –by going in for the “**rights**” approach in everything- from water to health .To our mind , the organic aspects are better served by “**entitlements**” - the difference being that with “rights” a person can seek redressal “afterwards”- if the due is not given while in an “entitlement” the due is deducted “beforehand” viz. under “rights” a person living near a river could challenge in courts if the water from the dam is not given to him while in an entitlement the water to a dam / industry/ collective would be given “**after**” supplying it to the last catchment individual.( Water of stakeholders would be deducted “**before**” giving it to the shareholders)

**Governance** style was moderated and calibrated way- less of **regulation** and more of governance. Both collective as well as **cumulative** leadership was in play besides the role of guardianship- leading from behind. The governance agenda was

mostly about setting new departments, shutting down non-performing schemes etc. there was hardly any time to present a vision for various departments nor for many policy initiatives till the fag end of first year. Governance too got politicised given the factional equations. Lack of experience was evident in governance while regulation was eased. **Oddball innovation** was once again in evidence in the new form of cabinet comprising all ministers of cabinet rank. Otherwise, Cabinet meets were much much more earnest—perhaps on account of the Sword of Damocles hanging overhead.

The entire focus of **administration** was on delivering the top priorities of manifesto apart from the low hanging fruits. Admin expected to be bamboozled instantly but there was a nuanced rearrangement initially. However, after a lull the floodgates broke loose to clear the mess at the last mile and Mantralaya. Only difference was that it was done by the elected members than non-state actors. In other words, from a **share market approach** to transfers and postings under BJP (it always helped if you engaged a broker) the modus operandi became **industrial** with Congress (a direct approach with cash). Administration has thereafter adopted a more managerial approach. The impression is of Congress politicians dominating civil servants (while being controlled by them) from BJP controlling bureaucrats (while being dominated by them)—in intellectual and social matters respectively. For most part of the year, civil servants sat on the fence with the spectre of destabilising noises. Only towards the end of one year did the change really sink in. Consequently, while they dealt decently with the unknown (e.g. loan waiver), against unknowable and unexpected (heaviest monsoons in living memory) *babus* faltered.

The **budget** 2019 of Madhya Pradesh was hardly that - it was merely a manager's statement of accounts -cum -Munshi's *Bahi Khaata*. While it was better than the recent state budgets – as also the latest Union budget- in that it was relatively rigorous in numbers yet it fell short in lacking a vision. It can be termed as a “**complementary budget**” (rather than supplementary) since the major items in interim budget presented before LS polls were left out to a great extent in the main budget. Granted that post GST, the conventional budget has become largely defunct as there is little scope for taxation by the state governments and there are limits to public borrowing. All that remains is juggling of priorities and allocations besides raising funds from natural resources/ commodities and data. An



innovative- improvising approach could've been adopted ; instead the easier way out of enhancing tax on petrol outside the budget , improving the ease of liquor business and attempting greater revenue from the real estate was adopted. The hiding from scrutiny approach was continued in the form of mammoth **supplementary budget** amounting over a tenth of the original budget. While bringing industry back onto the focus was welcome but before one could congratulate based on concrete signs , things fell apart . ( For details, read the essay “ Complimentary budget of a glorified Manager” at [www.mpmmediaplatform.com](http://www.mpmmediaplatform.com))

**Investors' summit** was organised in a business like manner with over a lakh crore of realistic projects with a promise of 2 lakh jobs. **What was the complete picture** ?A rough and ready guesstimate could be to weigh the sum of concessions , incentives given with the overall investment claims. For instance, if the value of total land given or FAR increase adds up to the more than the current claims of total investment worth one lakh crores then it has to be compensated with more jobs or greater capacity building .Our estimate is that the concessions were greater than equal to investment. That too is more than welcome –as it improves equity by creating jobs. Only when concessions are fifteen percent or more over and above the investment , it is a cause for worry .For ,that would mean transferring wealth from public to corporate... Care must be taken to compensate the **existing industries** against subsidies to the new ones( It has been done).Wherever conditions are tweaked the matching commitments too must be tweaked rationally. viz. if the lease has been increased from 33 years to 99 yrs , the condition of jobs too should be increased over three generations instead of one. Maximum watch has to be kept on two tools of neo colonization - resources and data. Ideally data should be collected by the government to the maximum extent and provided for only single use for one time payment–like the OTP. Presently , the state may not be in a position to quantum crunch data but in days to come it'll become a raw material for governance. Another **benchmark** ought to be foreign investment , exports- only one major investment could be spotted by an Israeli firm and export expansion by the Trident group – too little to pass any judgment but at least a beginning was made. First time investors is another indicator of the leverage of the CM and the new government- India Cements was the standout commitment.

PC Sharma , Chief Secretary and others kept throwing numbers - for investments ranging from 40 thousand crores to one lakh crores and from one lakh to two lakh jobs. It was more of a People's relation than Public relations exercise –masses like big numbers but classes get put off by poor math. **Congress wasn't gracious enough** to acknowledge the groundwork done by BJP- both visible and invisible – the infrastructure and putting a foot in the door by MOU's. The overall transformation of the meet was from “**secret**” to “**hidden**” – not open or transparent. Global investors summit was secretive about the facts on ground and the Investor's meet has kept the figures on board hidden. Being opaque about the numbers created uncertainty. This has implications for the implementation. By acknowledging and involving the opposition , Congress may have bought some sort of insurance policy against sabotage .Alternately , it became an all out war on ground. BJP knew that if it allowed that to fructify , its innings as the opposition may be much longer than a single term. Government announced some investments pre – meet , others during the meet and rest are slated to concretise later. There was not much room for defaulters – it is perform or perish for Congress. ( For details read the Essay : “ Magnificent M.P - from extractive to transactional” on [www.mpmmediaplatform.com](http://www.mpmmediaplatform.com) ).

The **LS results** though bad for Congress proved to be a blessing in disguise for the state and citizens –the government set out with double gusto to earn the mandate rather than benefitting from TINA factor.

As for the **state of the economy** - metaphorically speaking , money has been raised by selling the kidneys ( Land , Mines , data etc. ) and donating the liver ( furthering ease of drinking / liquor business ) besides mortgaging the future ( market loans and gross incentivizing the real estate sector) .Nothing wrong in it for a developing state but care should be taken to get the correct price for organs donated – brokers shouldn't take the major cut leaving the patient with neither the kidney nor money ; mortgage rates should be redeemable. Besides ,the money ought to be solely invested in growth initiatives. Furthermore , the trading of charges with the Central government had merits on both sides. As all other governments this one too has juggled figures and used the central funds for other purposes that allotted for , even if temporarily – esp. in the face of red taping the flow from the other end. There is no other magic wand to have survived

without defaulting otherwise. Talking of the **economy** as a whole-it was efficiently managed, to say the least.

On the **social front**, the effort was to nudge it from communal to community- which is easier said than done. Relief and succor in case of hailstorm and mishaps was a tad less. The message was of lack of empathy in administration. It has been a **mixed performance** at best- to put it mildly.

If one had to single out **one path breaking** stuff politically ,it would be initiating the process for **Vidhan Parishad** and avoiding vindictive politics viz. not abolishing Jan Abhiyan Parishad. The singular stand out decision in Governance was revival of **district government**. Two corrective measures caught public fancy -the move against adulteration and dismantling organised crime mafia. On the administrative side **two outstanding innovations** were - waiving the loan upto 50000 of “all” farmers including non- defaulters (so that law abiding do not get shortchanged) and giving matching concessions to existing industries as incentives for prospective investors ( so as to reward loyalty )

On the flip side ,to pinpoint the two **major wrongs** – they would be engaging with global giants in sunrise areas ( Sun Pharma , Facebook mentoring etc.).The twin tools of global dominance in this century- **resource colonisation** and **data mining**- would fully come into play if hard negotiations are not done for a win-win approach. Our data as well as **biodiversity** is as valuable , if not more , as the tech and capital of these giants. Data and resource decentralization hold the key .Else , MP would be on the road to be the second digital colony after Jharkhand. Another risky stuff – the **Facebook mentoring initiative** - empowering digitally – Public service has to do it.This is Facebook Zero in a different garb and ought to be avoided- instead **create intranets** ( Russia has already created one).The second dangerous proclamation is about extending the Chhindwara model across the state. Its capital intensive –cum- cheap labour approach should be moderated and calibrated lest the state becomes an **internal colony** in the long run.

It is said that “work” should not only be done but also “ seen” to be done- (*Jo Dikhta hai who Bikta hai* ).To which our addition is “Service” should not merely be provided but also be “ felt” – (*Jo mahsoos hota hai who tikta hai* ). By this dictum while the Kamalnath Govt kept working hard but its projection could

have been better ; it was service oriented( welfare / succor / correcting past wrongs) - but was not “felt”-that requires time more than money among the last person/section / beneficiaries. Many governments have lost out despite good work only because the “feeling” was not right-Chandrababu Naidu , Atal Behari and to a lesser extent Manmohan Singh , Shivraj Chauhan are prime examples.

**At the end of it, how did the overall scenario look like ?** Polity showed signs of stabilising- The return of lobbyists and “dynamic” officers in plum positions hinted that the government stabilised. However , beyond that things didn’t improve noticeably (Of course , it turned out to be a red herring , courtesy Operation Lotus). Did institutions work better ? If Vidhan Sabha was anything to go by, it was more of the same- curtailed sessions , walkouts and playing to the gallery sans any serious debate or discussion. Any improvement in **governance** ? Too short a period to say - while many ministers were earnest, more than a handful didn’t exactly cover themselves in glory. On the other hand ,there was a distinct improvement in regulation. What about **administration**? It was shaken and stirred yet most officers were biding time - esp. the dedicated ones- just in case the government fell.They did not seem to share the earnestness of political class. Management –esp. at *Mantralaya*- improved but administration - particularly in the field resisted reform.On the **corrective front** ,how did the government fare ? People were a bit disappointed at no action taken on the big ticket charges of systemic corruption like Vyapam , E- tender , tree plantation etc. though towards the end there was an all out attack on illegal construction , land grabbers and mining mafia (*makaan , dukaaan and khadaan* ) – the three darkest areas of last mile corruption in previous regime.However the tendency to throw the baby with bathwater too was evident viz. insistence a upon dismantling Jan Abhiyan Parishad.(could’ve been embedded)

The problem with giving up ideological differences is that you merely get a change in government but not a structural or systemic change. Besides, the chances of systemic failures like Vyapam ,Honey trap increase since everyone gets involved in the muck. This is fraught with danger - while in the short term , small matters it may succeed but in all key affairs there could be sabotage and the long term revival of the party may be scuttled.

At the end of one year , government presented its **report card** and individual ministers too listed their achievements . Besides , it presented a **vision document** for the next five years .It was claimed that 365 of the promises made in the Manifesto ( Vachan Patra) have been addressed. To begin with the *Vachan Patra* is not merely tough -it is impossible to deliver-given its over 900 items. It is only a slight improvement over 21 thousand odd announcements of Shivraj . Even if the claim is taken is taken at face value in the light of 44. 5 percent vote that Congress got , it translates into 33 percent marks ( barely passing) .To achieve more ,you must continue the good works of previous regime and also address the major points of their manifesto too. The vision document -on the face of it-was a glorified Plan, a compilation. Even that is welcome since it marks a step towards intellectuality. It appears to be better than the one presented by Shivraj on two counts – firstly , it has been presented in the first year while BJP presented it towards the end. Besides , it seems to be more rigorous and realistic which is reflected even in the title- from **Vision to delivery**. While the talk of building a New Madhya Pradesh and creating 10 lakh jobs (@ 2 lakh a year ) mayhave been overenthusiatic ,the entire exercise was a step towards more responsible and accountable government.

All in all, both parties played tactically- hoping for the other to make a mistake. Government approach was of **managing consent** and administering consensus ; a slight improvement on Union government's manufacturing consent and aborting dissent .In the best case scenario , it ought to be agreed consent and evolving consensus. Corporate culture is OK but has limitations too- in the Indian context it has to be complemented by the style of family run companies . Cooperative and Mom -Pop traders also have to be accommodated . The thumb rule ought to be- No new promises till previous one initiated. The current pace was **unsustainable** and popular expectations unsatiable . The government did manage to bring some order and sanity into the chaos and anarchy ( which was not all bad – it had an underlying order - a method in madness which benefitted those behind the scenes).

There was mostly corrective approach (*Sudhaar*) and incremental change (*Badlav*)- the only big change happened in governance - from **dedicated** of previous regime ( following the social charter and representatives of ruling party alone ) to **committed** (toeing the agenda of only party in power and its

leaders). In both cases the neutral citizen stood shortchanged. It was hoping to see an apolitical (not non-political) government...The journey was from moonwalking to treadmill -government aimed to bring it to jogging by the end of its term ...Shaping the state into a runner was to follow...Instead, Operation Lotus suddenly stopped the machine, throwing the runner on ground.

\*\*\*

### POST SCRIPT

- At the end of it, who were the greatest gainers? Biggest losers? Initially, the greatest gainer was undoubtedly Kamalnath followed by his son Nakulnath, Chhindwara district, and Kamalnath faction of Congress. Next big block of gainers were Digvijay and family-Son, wife, brother nephews, his faction in Congress; Congress party and state were the other gainers. Scindia and Shivraj seemed to be the biggest losers followed by BJP and Shivraj faction- Operation Lotus turned it all on its head.
- Overall, in the cabinet those with previous experience (Govind Singh Sajjan Verma, Vijaylakshmi Sadho etc.) and the ones with pedigree and education (Jaivardhan, Priyvrat, Sachin) performed well. Those with neither experience nor education/pedigree took to factionalism in the name of godfathers (Pradyuman, Tulsi, Imarti et al) -they failed to realize that they had to deliver twice as much to get half the credit. The mid rangers (Like Bala Bachchan) need a mix of transactional- cum-sharing approach. Agreed that post 1990s, leaders have become more like board directors but people like Bala needn't copy his leader in purely transactional approach. (Bala's video asking people to join/vote Congress in return for a Community hall became viral)
- Only a handful of Ministries came up with policies/ drafts- Industry, Tourism, Excise, Mining -...If you keep drafting a policy till mid term - when will you implement it?
- Kamalnath gave himself 60 Percent in an interview. Some may think it as being modest but that is the maximum any CM with 44 percent vote and

49%seats could've done. Kamalnath 1.0 was Sanjay Gandhi-Narsimha Rao redux ( My way or highway – managing a minority govt. with all tricks of the game ). His physical legacy was ensured (virtually all important Buildings /schemes have his Name- Vallabh Bhawan annexe , New Madhya Pradesh Bhavan in Delhi , MadhyaLok in Mumbai ,Metro et al .On the negative side, giving projects to his constituency disproportionately–brought out label of “ Chhindwara Ka CM ” .

- Congress usurped the BJP template in the state as was evident in the Jhabua By-election: making the rebel BJP candidate file nomination ; 100 BJP workers joining Congress days before polling ,fielding a super heavy candidate – Kantilal Bhuria et al...This has decreasing dividend - doppleganger can at best be a substitute ,never a teplacement of the original.
- Some extraneous boosters for government came from CMIE reports of a 40% reduction in unemployment in M.P. during Kamalnath regime - from 7.2 to 4.8 (In the same period the national unemployment increased from 5 to 8%) One survey ranked Kamalnath as the best CM while on the other hand ,in GOI reports M.P slipped to 9<sup>th</sup> rank in Governance.
- Thru its various programmes and schemes the govt. touched different **sections**. Women-51 thousand rupees for marriage ; Youth - Swabhiman Yojana; Pensioners - made the pensions up to date with D.A. etc.;
- Different programmes impacted various **classes** Upper-Incentives for investment ;Middle - Electricity Bill major relief .;Lower-**Naya Savera**.
- Touched various **sectors** via its policies .Agri –loan waiver Industrialists- policies, incentives, Service- Astt. Proff appointment.
- By cabinet decisions various **castes** Upper castes – 10% Economic quota accepted. OBC- 27% Reservation attempted ; SC/ST - tribal loan waivers/debit cards.
- By a planned approach the govt . reached out tovarious **regions**

Mahakaushal-Medical college ,University;Malwa-metro; Gwalior-Chambal: Gwalior Mela revived;Madhya Bharat-Metro ; Bundelkhand- Sagar Medical college extension; Chhattarpur Mining projects ; Baghelkhand-Cultural festivals.

- Overall 1 cr. people (20 lakh households) benefitted from the 100units free(100-150 rupee power tariff );Around 20 lakh farmers' loan waived (another 1cr people with overlap)... If even 20% population (1.5 cr)gets touched in the first year, it is decent.

\*\*\*

### **KAMAL-DIVIJAY- SCINDIA-SHIVRAJ REDUX: AVENGERS- REVENGERS**

( **Mission Kamal v/s Operation Lotus** )

**Shashidhar.S. Kapur**

Often during the recent Scindia drama, media titled its developing stories as “ Picture Abhi Baaki Hai ”( Film Continues...).As it got drawn out, some of them realised that it isn't a one off thing and modified it into “ Serial abhi baki hai ”(Serial Continues...). However, none of them realised that it is actually a **web series** – with layered plot , multiple sub plots comprising larger than life action , drama, treachery , backstabbing -spread across generations and numerous locales.

This essay is **less about individuals ,parties , events and incidents** than a commentary on the Madhya Pradesh brand of Politics. While the former tells more about changing power equation , latter gives its impact on the state as a whole and its citizens -in short , mid and long term. The historical background is dissected , current context analysed for trends and future direction projected.

**Madhya Pradesh model of Politics** is different from rest of the country. Those who are not sons of soil often fail to recognize it. Some years ago, a senior Congress leader from Delhi with interests in M.P. had commented after the



VYAPAM scam that “ People of Madhya Pradesh are not politicised enough...if VYAPAM happened in any other state, people would've come on the streets and toppled the government.” It is clear that the gentleman didn't understand the state politics. **These are regions which didn't fight against the British in a major way - for that matter against none prior to that for a Millennium.** Raja Bhoj ,the last great regional King is largely a mythical figure who lived a thousand years ago .In the absence of great warriors ,conflicts have been resolved mostly by compromises and adjustments; failing which there is deceit and backstabbing . From south of Chambal to north of Narmada -Tapti and Satpuras the region is a hot bed of dark politics .The dacoits of Chambal , Pindarees of North Central region, mercenaries of Bhopal zone ,Thugs of South east , dacoits of Eastern Chitrakoot –Mirzapur belt to Sikligars of south and Bhilalas of east constitute its of dark undercurrent. In other words , this area is **the dark heart of Indian politics**. At every juncture , this has come into play. These elements are evident in post independence era too. As the state was never integrated politically – being partly under the British and the rest ruled by monarchs – the modern polity too is disintegrated - which explains the rampant factionalism. The presence of substantial dark factor ensures greater **disruptive and subversive politics** than constructive and creative; coopting the opponents and sabotaging the rivals than winning them over or defeating them.Two major points of historical context include Raghogarh being a tributary of Scindias and the latter never managing to conquer Bhopal ; a minor point in broader context being the inability of Marathas to ever effectively control Delhi.

In Post independent India too, the traits surfaced from the beginning. During 1950's after integration when Nehru visited Gwalior , there was more cheer and clapping when Jiwaji Rao spoke as compared to PM's speech. JL was miffed and wryly commented “ Perhaps you people haven't realised that India is a democracy now... no longer ruled by monarchs”...**That was his duty as People's Leader than a dynast.** Every subsequent visit ensured a louder applause for Nehru. Those who had fought against the British deserved it .A little later , Congress managed to enlist Rajmata Vijay Raje into its fold after Jiwaji Rao showed no interest in politics. The Bonhomie continued till Nehru's death .After him – in 1960's , the local Congress strongman DP Mishra was not obsequious to Rajmata. Being a freedom fighter perhaps he had an natural antipathy to the

royals...The dynasty had tolerated a barb from Nehru but coming from one among the hoi polloi was ostensibly too much. She disrupted by cropping up GN Singh for a Samvid government and subsequently joined Jan Sangh. It was a case of **selective self-respect**. In the 70's Indira Gandhi abolished privy purses and later jailed Rajmata during Emergency in the knowledge that she was funding RSS. With pressure ramping up ,her son Madhavrao decided to cover all the family bases and joined Congress. That was abrupt that he was supported by Jan Sangh .At that point ,**Vijayaraje made a comment about princelings not having guts**. Eventually ,in the 80's Vijayaraje was one of the founders of BJP, the principal opposition to Congress .Slightings from Delhi continued when Madhavrao was not considered for CM with Rajiv Gandhi forwarding the names of Arjun Singh and Motilal Vora besides simultaneously promoting Digvijay for the state unit.The 90's brought in another opportunity for Madhav Rao to be CM but Kamalnath -Digvijay duo scuttled it – it is anybody's guess if that could've happened without Delhi's blessings , expressed or otherwise. However , Madhav Rao was compensated with a ministerial position in the Union cabinet .Narasimha Rao continued the Delhi tradition by implicating Madhav Rao in Hawala diary case. Once again there was twin pressure - from Delhi and Madhya Pradesh forcing him to quit and firm his own outfit. Accidental death of Madhav Rao brought Jyotiraditya into electoral politics suddenly , earlier than due. Two decades into the new millennium the double whammy of losing the Lok Sabha and slighted by the state leadership brought out the **Scindian trait** and he **disrupted** .

Parallel to Congress' explosions is the story of BJP/ Jan Sangh **implosions** The party implodes whenever there is simultaneous subversion -cum- disruption. From Deendayal Upadhyaya- Balraj Madhok , Atal Behari - Nanaji Deshmukh to Modi- Sanjay Joshi and Shivraj- Prabhat Jha , there have been several Pokhrans. Being implosions ,they're not visible on surface and remain hidden from public eye.Thus there is factionalism in Congress and groupism in BJP ( *Dhadebazi* and *Patthebazi* respectively ).Congress' explosions are like street fights / battles/ wars while BJP's implosions are like family dramas – every man on the street debates the former whereas even neighbours avoid discussing the latter publicly. To circumvent this , leaders of both parties have devised **a ploy of twinning with another leader** at Delhi or Bhopal as the case may be. Digvijay , Shivraj , Uma Bharti all went to Delhi first before parachuting at Bhopal while Delhi based

Kamalnath twinned with Bhopal .Shymacharan and Vidhyacharan had stayed solely in Bhopal and Delhi respectively ( basically top down –cum- grassroots up.). Jyotiraditya had firmed up with Rahul before landing in the state. Only when this twinning breaks or weakens that explosion or implosions occur , often **cross twinning with a leader of the other faction or party** -Rajmata with GN Singh , Jyotiraditya with Shivraj etc..

In this context ,even the **current case** draws many parallels. In 1967 it was **Chambal aur Mahal** ( Palace and dacoits) which toppled D P Mishra’s government ; come 2020 it is **Kothi** and **Chor** ( Villa and thieves)- to quote Dr. Govind Singh who compared the absconding Mla’s to thieves . Another similarity is that in 1967 too, Congress had lost elections in many states – which made the Madhya Pradesh winning leaders a bit cocky within the party. Continuing in the same vein about past ,Shyamacharan had called **Kamalnath a migratory bird** ; disgruntled local politicians from both parties are saying it again . Another echo from history is Jyotir’s father too complaining about the same thing -on entering his 50’s- he had said “I’m a grandfather within the extended family and yet not considered senior enough within the party for certain positions.” In the light of above , main plot of **Operation Lotus** was about replacing the people’s government with a popular government – the one which had won more seats with that which had won more votes. Sweeping LS victory had further bolstered the sense of entitlement. The subplots included subversion and / or disruption- simultaneously, if needed. Moreover , it had to be executed before the Local bodies’ elections lest the party with more seats in VS swung the popular vote too in its favour.

\*\*\*

The **first episode** of current series too has a longer backstory than most people guess. Flashback : In 2013, Jyotiraditya was offered to become the PCC chief.He declined given that he was a union minister and the state unit was in tatters . Politically it might have been the right move but socially a **missed opportunity** to become a guardian- a grassroots leader.After 2014 ,for the first time in Jyotiraditya’s political life ,Congress away from power both at centre and state (barring a brief period between November 2003 and May 2004).Existential threat brought peace with historical rivals brokered by Sonia Gandhi in 2018.While

Kamalnath integrated the leaders with his experience and moneybags ,Digvijay united the workers with his long connect and drill ; Scindia became the poster boy to get the first time and floating voters. Things came to a head at the time of ticket distribution with Digvijay and Scindia having an extremely heated exchange in the presence of Rahul Gandhi. It was papered over given the criticality of the juncture. The 2018 results pleasantly surprised Congress and jolted BJP. However, **both misread the mandate**. It was **against Shivraj** not BJP and in favour of **Team Congress** and not any particular leader .Shivraj tried to give it a spin of technical victory in the slightly higher number of votes polled overall and Scindia saw himself as the main lead. Jyotiraditya being rebuffed for CM's post and Shivraj restrained from attempting horse trade made them grumpy even if they didn't show it .The rumours that Modi- Shah had used Shivraj as **the anti-incumbency release valve** for LS 2014 and Kamal- Diggi utilised Jyotir merely as a mascot- made both the poster boys **harbour a grouse**.Thus within days of Kamalnath swearing in , Jyotiraditya visited Shivraj's house in public view . Perhaps the virtual seeds of future realignment were sown- **one line story of the drama to unfold**. Shortly afterwards the Cabinet formation made fissures deeper .It is claimed that Scindia was offered Deputy CM's post but he declined. Rightly so, since he would have been cornered. Instead he suggested the name of his supporter Tulsi Silawat for the position .How could Kamalnath accept it ? It would've antagonised others. So the CM suggested to have two Deputy CM 's which Scindia is reported to have declined. The Ministry formation continued in the same line with an oddball innovation of appointing all cabinet ministers – supposedly to accommodate Digvijay's son as cabinet minister-**the first major mistake of Diggi**. This had precisely the same impact as two Deputy CM's would have - resentment. It was unfolding as a story of **overambition and underestimation**- of self and opponent respectively.

First session of VS marked the **second episode**. It was less than graceful with BJP playing sore loser and deciding to contest the Speakers' post which is conventionally given to the ruling party. Round one went to Congress as they not only won the Speaker's post but also took away the Deputy Speaker's position-traditionally reserved for the opposition...With surgical strikes failing the saffron brigade resorted to its weapon of choice- subversion. **As usual ,it began at the lowest level** with small time employees trying to sabotage the electricity supply in

the name of maintenance , small time traders tried to create a shortage of fertiliser besides raising a disproportionate hue and cry about damaged roads post heaviest monsoons in ages. The idea was to revive the Bijli , Sadak , Pani bogey of Digvijay regime .This standard dark template was effectively blocked by a vigilant Congress. It was followed by the next higher level of subversion in the **passive resistance of “dedicated” officers** – government dealt it aggressively with wholesale transfers. Stage was now set for the **highest** level sabotage – by the legislators.

Congress adopted the approach of **managing consent and controlling dissent** as against the Modi -Shah policy of manufacturing consent and aborting dissent ( That requires the use of government machinery and RSS family ). Naturally the impact of former is far less and shortlived.

Meanwhile , the BJP leaders kept looking for an opening by continuously throwing barbs about an unstable government – didn’t allow it to stabilise. Consequently , in the **third episode** over the following VS session Congress made a **fatal mistake** of exposing its cards by attempting subversion- a BJP speciality -by making two MLAs Narayan Tripathi and Sharad Kol vote with the government on criminal law bill. Immediately , the dirty tricks department of BJP sprung into action and its blackbelt Narottam Mishra commented “ You’ve begun this ( dirty ) game , we will end it .”

Post VS , Jyotir was given the charge of East UP - it is said that equating with a newbie like Priyanka Gandhi perhaps made him feel diminished .LS results cleared any remaining ambiguity about the meaning of VS results .Once again the leaders of both parties either misread it or pretended so. It was clear that **people had voted to get BJP in and keep Shivraj out ; they had voted for Congress leaders coming together** and put the party on probation. Shivraj did not have a major role in LS elections nor could Congress cobble up a mega pre-poll alliance. Kamalnath’s son managed to win by a thin margin , Digvijay suffered a huge loss and Scindia was humiliated in his family borough. The message for Kamalnath was to avoid being a dynast and parochial ; Digvijay was told in no uncertain terms to remain in the background and Scindia was communicated that work alone was not enough- people wanted service too... **Defeating your opponent not enough , you had to win people’s hearts too.** All three of them

while putting a brave front publicly were shaken to the core in all likelihood. Kamalnath would've known that his inability to value add to the LS tally showed that the VS vote was not for him alone ;Diggi would know for certain that the margin of defeat could not have materialised without back stabbers and Scindia surely realised that the global norm of dynasties fading after three generations has come into play –that defeat in Kolaras VS seat was no aberration.

Rahul shutting off after LS too didn't help matters - in fact , it made them worse for the young brigade. Consequently the **fourth episode** saw seniors brazen it out instead of becoming humble. Kamalnath began acting beyond the *Vachchan Patra* and mandate before consolidating-viz. planning IIFA ; Digvijay tried Gerrymandering Bhopal politics by carving out two municipalaities and indirect Mayorial elections and Scindia angled for PCCchief. It is said that he was offered the position but Jyotir wanted his nominee which was unacceptable to the anti-Scindia lobby. Kamalnath made a **serious political faux pas** at this juncture – offering Dy .CM could've bought some time. The seniormost duo of Congress got emboldened went about the I, me ,mine business - Davos , Investors' meet , Chhindwara ,son of Kamalnath ; son ,wife , family of Diggi. **Emergence of twin power centres hastened the crash date.** The calculation was that at least 38 Cong Mlas would be needed for a breakaway group to avoid anti- defection law; alternatively , if around 11 Mlas cross voted during RS elections or resigned to bring govt into minority, a similar number of Sleeper cells could be activated within the BJP. They seem to have not heard of **sleeper batteries-** -those leaders within who would defect- a recurring phenomenon in Indian politics.

Meanwhile , in the **fifth segment** Kamalnath went about taking decisions at breakneck speed reminiscent of the minority Narasimha Rao government bringing in maximum reforms .Nath had played a key floor management role in that too. All this while , Jyotiraditya was further sidelined. He dropped several hints like changing his twitter timeline from Congressman to Public servant , forcibly convening the smart city meetings in his palace , attending official meeting while being a persona non- grata etc. Simultaneously ,he had begun dropping hints to BJP via Zafar Islam sometime after LS results – JS was two timing. In the second half of 2019 he was sent away from the state again to supervise ticket distribution in Maharashtra . There too Kamalnath eventually stole

his thunder when he proved to be the clincher of the Sena-Cong -NCP deal. That was a direct affront to Modi-Shah. Kamalnath had to be dethroned ASAP. Around the same time, Jyotiraditya approached Rahul Gandhi to discuss the PCC chief issue – instead he was **redirected to KC Venugopal**. Rebuffed Scindia felt stuck between a rock and a hard place. He couldn't be PM or AICC chief (at the national level ) and now even CM or PCC chief was getting out of bounds. Thus the maximum he could extract from either party at this point in time was Union Cabinet position via the Rajya Sabha route. He had two options going by the family template – Jyotir could either go his father's way or follow his grandmother's footsteps .The third option was to create a new template – of sacrificing self interest for the party – at least a little longer .The choice was between **compromise and sacrifice**. Scindia merely **fastracked his promotion** thru compromise.This time too the duration of being out of power was the same as 2003-4.

The **sixth and penultimate** battle stage was candidature to the Rajya Sabha elections . Leading to the nominations there was a rumour - correct or planted - that Digvijay would be the first choice candidate and Jyotir the second option. Some even went to the extent of suggesting that Scindia might not be considered at all - instead Deepak Saxena, the Chhindwara MLA who vacated his seat for Kamalnath may be fielded as compensation. Perhaps that was the last straw – it instilled fear of god in Scindia – having lost LS, losing RS in quick succession could be politically fatal. The insecurity found expression in him challenging Kamalnath Publically in a rally of guest teachers that he'd join their protest on streets if the demand wasn't fulfilled .To which Nath **rightly retorted** “ *Toh Aa jaayen*” ( Let him do it) .Challenging your own party CM publically is not acceptable by any standards. Besides , pushing a North Indian / *Khatri*/ Punjabi is always counter productive. They belong to the cat family – not all of them overly aggressive but if you push them ,they dig their heels in and eventually counter attack when against a wall. From Moghuls to Indira Gandhi learnt this at a great cost.

In the **seventh and final episode of the first edition** Saffron brigade went for a kill. Plan “A” of Operation Lotus was to get 11 or more Congress Mlas' to cross vote in the RS elections and thereafter claim that government was in a minority -perhaps by snatching some independents too. However , that was fraught with

danger as cross voting **would expose the possible defectors** – particularly the number. It was reported that Congress had created as many sleeper cells within BJP. If reverse cross over happened, it would mean status quo. Thus subversion alone may not have been enough. A fool proof Plan “B” had to be **disruption-cum -subversion** simultaneously. To get the Congress’ big gun cross over alongwith defectors. It had to be double - o - quits. Make the defectors an offer they couldn’t refuse - cum - threats they couldn’t face. For all you know, Plan A could’ve been a red herring. The bottom line was - if the strongest possible BJP state team couldn’t defeat Congress- it could have grave implications in the entire Hindi belt, if not nationwide. It was almost entirely scripted and executed by Scindia with BJP providing logistical support and cover.

The Groundwork for Plan B had started soon after LS elections. With the knowledge of Scindia’s **loser’s mindset** after Kolaras and Guna, BJP leaders missed no opportunity to rub the salt in by pointing that he wasn’t getting his due in the Congress. Jyotiraditya was in a dilemma given that his father’s route was that of a winner - having defeated Atal Behari and performed marvelously as the railway minister. Like in Maharashtra where Mrs. Rashmi Thakre and Supriya Sule played a pivotal role in stitching the coalition, in MP too Ladies were roped in. From the Baroda Royals- in laws of Jyotiraditya - to his aunts, all were in the loop. Rajmata Shubhangini Raje Gaekwad, his mother -in-law was the bridge between the top BJP leadership and Jyotiraditya Scindia and Modi. (Incidentally, she was the proposer of Modi’s candidature in 2014 from Baroda). A combination of loser’s mindset and ladies’ penchant for safety prevented any adventure on Jyotir’s part and he rolled over. **It is a story of fear and greed.** In Bihar the mandate was looted, in Maharashtra it was twisted, in MP it was stolen. Statesmen are supposed to be fearless and selfless.

Like all web series, the ‘hooks’ of next edition were woven into the last episode. In this case the clues lie in various acceptance and resignation speeches. Shivraj welcomed Scindia into BJP office by comparing him with “*Vibhishan*”. An interesting point is that **no Indian ever names his child** after that noble man who squealed for a righteous cause. Jyotiraditya tried to play the commoners’ card by saying that he and Shivraj are the only ones who move in cars without A/C. Furthermore he gave it a spin of self - respect and settling scores while reminding about Rajmata’s act. Selective self-respect again? It turned out to be a saga of



revengers rather than avengers. In his resignation speech Kamalnath said “ I tried **to bring the palace into Congress than Congress go to Palace** and ended by saying that there is tomorrow after to day and there is a day after...” Shivraj acceptance speech at BJP legislator’s meet hinted at new version “ You’ll see a change in governance style.”**The first Edition ended with** swearing in function .The series turned out to be a saga of revengers than avengers-doing another wrong for past wrong than correcting it .Dark ecosystem again?.Would the next edition correct that ?Uma Bharti meeting Kamalnath thereafter was akin to Scindia meeting Shivraj - both backstabbed by partymen- **a teaser** for the next edition ?. A tweet by Congress saying that “ **Kamalnath will hoist the tricolor on nextIndependence day** ” was a fanboy reaction. **Trailer** came out in post –Covid Local Bodies’ elections wherein Congress gained substantially. 2023 remains the release date for second edition ,on schedule.

\*\*\*

**Why don’t parties and families learn their lessons ?** Congress party didn’t learn from 1967 episode of Rajmata ,BJP failed to learn from Gujarat – allowing Shivraj beyond third term a la Modi; Scindia failed to learn from family history of inability to capture Bhopal four times ( In 1813,1967,1986,1993) ; Rahul failed to learn from 1857 role of Scindias ; Digivijay failed to learn from 2003 in going against the popular mood , Kamalnath failed to learn from 1993 when he had fielded his wife –in promoting the family too much ; Shivraj failed to learn in coming from back door the second time (will pay the price)... all this because these collective bodies have little space for “ different” views – and absolutely no space for “opposite” view. They nourish only soft varieties of journalists , thinkers,lawyers , critics ...consequently at every critical moment, they repeat the mistakes ...Unless they encourage counter view within the bodies they will not be able to manage opponents . Vidhan Parishad , Intra party democracy , space for independent candidates , strong grassroots bodies and powerful frontal organisations etc. are some of the ways to evolve.

While there may be some truth in **the grouses of absconders , most of it is bunkum**. If the prestige of Scindia was hurt with Kamalnath retort – what about the prestige of CM ? Ideally , Kamalnath should’ve called him privately later and

assuaged- wonder if he tried. In rebuking **Kamalnath merely carried forward Nehru's legacy-** of showing the palace its place in a democracy.

On the other hand , if Scindia had any **self – respect** ,he should've actually come on the streets and negotiated or revolted. Disrespecting the mandate was hitting below the belt. The complaint by most of the MLA 's of Kamalnath being inaccessible is only partially true .One year is too short a period to pass a judgement. By the way , has anyone complained of lack of access to Modi ? That **Kamalnath didn't lend ear-** wouldn't listen beyond 20 min., more often will cut you short in 10...The Kamalnath ministers were naïve. Somebody of Nath's experience knew the drift of their talk within the first few minutes- he was being kind if he gave 10 min for rambling ; 20 min was a luxury ; asking beyond that blasphemy... Ask anyone in the final years of Shivraj's third term-CM had severe attention deficit. Even Subramaniam Swamy cannot get Modi's ear- the less said about other ,the better. The test was to be if Shivraj reaches out as much as his previous stints and yet delivers...Chouhan succeeded in former and failed the latter.

The historical context too proves that Jyotir was **incorrect**. Shyamacharan's grouse about Kamalnath being a migratory bird was incorrect too.While locals may “grow” to be the best , it is only through migrants that communities “ progress” - become unique- they provide the complementary difference. Madhav Rao's grouse at not being made the CM too was a bit misplaced .It is unlikely that he would have been able to juggle factionalism the way Digvijay managed in his first term. It required street-fighting skills and not battle training ; street-smartness and not smartness. Digvijay had acquired those while operating at the municipal level politics and as a student of GSTI. Presidency, Harvard , Stanford ,Lok Sabha , Union Cabinet doesn't teach you that. Similarly , at this point in time Jyotiraditya's grouse at being overlooked for CM was misdirected. **There is no way Scindia could've managed to last half as long as Kamalnath in this tricky mandate.**

As with all such murky scenarios a lot of **dirty secrets** are talked about .Some of them include closure of EOW case on Mahalgaon, linkages with the Yes Bank scam ,Union help in sorting out family property dispute ... Similar stuff was insinuated about **Benami** properties in Gwalior in the late seventies after the

Urban Land ceiling Act when Madhavrao switched sides ... It is an open secret that around 1000 crores changed hands (@ 35 cr per mla)... Given that more than twice the amount had been spent by BJP for merely 8 Surat region seats in Gujarat elections is an indicator of **political purchasing power parity** ... Of course, the traders too had to be compensated for Demonetisation loss informally. That the E-Tendering, Honey trap, VYAPAM and other cases could not be delayed much further **fast forwarded** the kill.

At the end of the day, **Biggest winners of yesterday have turned out to be the biggest losers of today** and vice-versa( Kamal-Diggi and Shivraj-Scindia ) .Seen as a whole everybody has lost sheen. In fact this goes onto affirm that this is the darkest political space .There have been cases of ideologically opposing parties joining hand post results, such a big chunk crossing ever in a two party system is **rare** but perhaps **never** have two Projected faces come together within a year. **This is a new low**. MP, the hub of dark politics has emerged as the sanctuary of dark politicians too. No leaders or representatives-only saboteurs, subversionists, opportunists and political managers. Within this a state of disrupters Gwalior- Chambal region stands out .You never know when a **Baagi** (rebel ) will turn **Daagi** (tainted) or vice versa -as exemplified by three tallest leaders of the region coming together(Scindia-Tomar- Narottam ) alongwith their flock. Other **Big winners** include Gwalior - Chambal region ; underperforming ministers ,Multiple time Mla's at the fag end and BJP. Secondary **Big losers** are the people of the state ,Congress ,Chhindwara- Mahkaushal and first time Mlas. .In State's history **never have so many people and organisations lost so much for the stake of so little**. The unsung hero of victory Digvijay was the most parodied villain, Superhero Kamalnath made to appear a virtual hero and superman Jyotiradiya like Darkseid.

Congress' **biggest mistake** was allowing Diggy to come to the forefront and Kamalnath 's minimal outreach besides massive intelligence failure . BJP's **biggest mistake** was allowing Shivraj to stay in the forefront thereby enabling him to make a comeback with Scindia's overreach -besides the failure of state unit to topple Kamalnath on its own.

Another set of losers is the party workers - particularly of Congress. However, much of their hue and cry is hollow as they hadn't fought much .Moreover, the

very fact that these people survived for 15 yrs is due to being coopted . Therefore, their claims were **overaspirational** . Besides, there was enough with BJP to armtwist them .Thus Shivraj with little or no frontal role in forming this government and Narottam who couldn't break Nath-Diggi fortress converted the voter from being the **real winner** to **surreal loser**. Those who were rejected by people hijacked and sabotaged their parties. All the routine reasons - caste , regional balance, tricky situation - for Shivraj comeback are **superfluous** . If you have money and manpower two persons from a relatively small state can rule the country and capture the party besides packing the administration with bureaucrats from home cadre. It is a story of **backstab and blackmail**.

A look at the **Role** of major players is illustrative of the malaise. **Governor** took a beating by first basing letters upon media reports and later facing disobedience. **Speaker** too didn't keep the spirit of Constitution in his selective approach to resignations. **Politicians** went into hiding like crooks; Representatives behaved more as gangsters in their negotiations; **legislators** treated like slaves with whips and party workers as pawns and employees .Not only the act of crossing over but the manner was shameful - the way they swore allegiance to an individual / dynast was akin to spitting on the electorate.

In the entire drama **AICC kept aloof** ; not even a tweet from Rahul-Sonia –Priyanka ;central observer Bawariya was hardly active ;Harish Rawat and Mukul Wasnik came in only perfunctorily .Once again it was established that in disrupting ,the **BJP worked as a JCB machine** from Delhi to Bangalore and Bhopal . **Courts** missed an opportunity of passing a landmark judgment. Looking at the recurring trend in Arunachal, Goa , Utrakhand , Karnataka , they could've referred it to a constitutional bench or allowed the caretaker government till by-elections. **A decision was delivered but not justice** .Technically , **a Minority government was replaced by another minority government** – even if all the 7 independents / minor party Mla's support the BJP the present tally is short of the hallway mark of full house strength. Such a decision could've formed a basis of some kind of **counter- subversion law** to complement the anti -defection law. This case had the potential to be as Landmark as the Bommai case. Regional **Media** reflected its sorry state yet again when its lack of rigour got exposed in the time of crisis .The mainstream media in playing the social media videos of absconding Mla's on its platforms without verifying on ground / fact check **became a party**.

Eventually , a press conference was held albeit with restricted access.

**Adminstrators** – particularly those with less than 15 yrs. service were shell shocked by the corporate style work culture. They had seen nothing like this before and felt demoted from **courtiers to managers**. In the **prevailing scenario** those officers who are **faceless** and retained by both parties in key posts are likely to be the best (Subject to fact-check) ; the ones in limelight and yet retained by successive regimes are slimy characters (“ **Saanp- Bichchu**” according to Gopal Bhargava).The entire scenario is the opposite of a healthy democracy- where close numbers would’ve brought the best out of every legislator and institutions.

**Operation Lotus** shattered or at least dented many **myths** in the process- about no factionalism in BJP ; that any CM who organises *Simhastha* doesn’t come back ( partially true for Shivraj- he lost only to return) ; BJP doesn’t come back soon after losing ; Kamalnath as political floor management Guru and Digvijay as great political manager .(Though quarterly reports are not sufficient indication – if the trends continue for three more quarters ,bankruptcy code may be invoked)

The **present state** of suspended animation is thanks to the **trends** of mercenary, brazen oligarchy with a veneer of populism - it is a **global scenario** with dark aspects **more pronounced in underdeveloped regions**; parties issuing Whips without a counterbalancing internal democracy ; voters becoming **impossibly demanding** in a 24/7 cycle forcing politicians to become extractive –beyond transactional.

Based on the above, **Future** could not have been very promising .Even if there were no Corona crisis not much could be hoped. **Impact** of this drama on **Polity** would be felt for a long time now that both parties got gripped by two leaders each –duopolies of sorts. They have now become **Private limited** company and **Family owned** company respectively - there are no corporate organisations like U.S. The operative aspects are so similar that the **ideological distinctions** are blurred. Arun Shourie called the Modi-Shah BJP as “ Congress with a cow...” In M.P. , Kamal-Diggi Congress has become “ **BJP with a Gaushala** ” At the national level, Congress is increasingly like New “ BJP alongwith Pedigree”; to match it, BJP in the states kidnapped a dynast to become Old “ Congress with dynasts ( **siyasat aur virasat** )”. While BJP has become a **Party of convenience** from a party with a

difference ,Congress looks like a **struggling party** -than the party of Independence movement .

**Shivraj** coming to the fore had **Diggi effect** on BJP-he is now what a RSS person said about Modi “A **scorpion** on a Shivling- you cannot lift him with your hand nor hit him with a chappal ” ; Scindia’s entry resulted in “ **Kamalnath effect**” on RSS workers– if they couldn’t attach to Yashodhara - Jyotiraditya is an even bigger “ **Shrimant**” .The” mistrust “ **Panja chaap Bhajapaayi**” just as Loyal Congress workers mistrust “ *Phool Chhap Congressi*” .

**Governance** took a hit. For, **no government by subversion ever delivers progress**. At best welfare and maintenance. Moreover, Shivraj and his **government has authority but no credibility** –that too curtailed by Jyotiraditya as **Supra CM**. It is more like a government of Gwalior-Chambal-Bhopal region. Shivraj was in office but not in power. That forced him to be **ruthless**. Perhaps that’s what he meant by hinting a change in governance style .Now that he has bamboozled the party , his legislators and supporters could run amuck. The style motto- crush the weak and pay obeisance to the powerful. **Administration** made fully “ **dedicated**”- pursuing the agenda of party than government. A tit for tat demand against some officers of Nath regime by Arvind Bhadoriya-a key player of the drama- is in line with new style. The fate of “**evergreen**” officers who managed plum positions in both regimes hung in balance as Chouhan tried to correct his image of being controlled by bureaucrats. More weightage given to legislators-esp. those who’d defected...

**Economy** which had only begun marginally bucking the downward national trend got worse post Covid-19.Policies of mining ,liquor and real estate reverted to the previous Shivraj regime to benefit the party workers than fill state coffers. Apolitical schemes such as free electricity for upto 100 units reversed and farm loan waivers suspended. **Dark economy** - adulterated food ,spurious drugs and fake goods - have a field day- particularly those supplying the government.

**Shivraj 4.0** showed all signs of a new governance style, **not necessarily better**. Having put his party to ransom Chouhan’s body language became more autocratic and impatient –of someone in my way or highway mode . It was evident in his continuing without a cabinet (esp. at such a critical Juncture) more than a fortnight after swearing in; passing confidence

motion by a voice vote in the absence of opposition ; ditto for budget ;Cancelling the appointments to various commissions and Statutory bodies- Human rights ,Women’s commission etc – they have a fixed tenure for 2 yrs and the decision is challengeable in courts .In calling them inappropriate due to last minute appointments , Shivraj conveniently forgot his major decisions in his last cabinet meet during the model code of conduct wherein sanctions to the tune of 800 cr. , clearance to Indore-Bhopal expressway etc. were made. Agreed, that two wrongs do not make a right ,the least he could’ve done in present case was to wait till by -polls. In the same vein , **immediate** administrative shake up carried out till CS ; punishments and reinstatements of uncomfortable officers too ;EOW closing Mahalgaon case ...It appears that he learnt the opposite lessons –those of dark politicians- centralising all decision making ,appearing solely on media even more than earlier , relying even more on officers than before ...in short, even more Presidential/Mukhiya than Shivraj3.0...

There was a **parallel** in Shivraj government to everything that Kamalnath faced- only the manner was different. It was evident **immediately** by the problem in Cabinet formation- followed by a **paradox** at every stage. If you include the turncoats and they lose , it means embarrassment ; if you do not include them – with what face would they face the polls ? If you give them the same ministry- the question would be that if they were performing well, why rock the boat ? If you do not give the same ministry the query would be- if they were incompetent , why include them ? Example of only one ministry would illustrate this – It was clear that post Covid, the health ministry would be extremely high profile . If given to Tulsi Silavat ,what about Narottam Mishra who held the portfolio in Shivraj 3.0 ? If both weremade Deputy CM – Mishra could feel slighted at being not even a clear number two - since he was angling for CM ship... ; Logically, in the **short term** (till by polls) all or most appointments to corporations and commissions needed to be made- the legislators would see it as their last chance for a pound of flesh in a longtime. While that may buy some time -resentment would grow ; things would exacerbate with lack of funds given the state of Economy-Hence , keep it hanging ;In the **Middle term the** Vidhan Sabha sessions proved farcical just as BJP didn’t listen to Congress and came on the streets during sessions , Congress didn’t allow BJP to speak causing ruckus.Thus

M.P. had a truly functioning anarchy – a free for all- in the **intermediate term** ...Parties kept scuttling sessions in the name of Covid.

The **following by polls** gave both parties a chance of changing the politics of Gwalior- Chambal for a long time – even a generation. In the **extreme view**, it was an existential battle for the palace or Congress in the region. Hardcore BJP/RSS workers went for the bust- as they'd tasted the logarithmic loss of decadal power in one year; besides in 2018, they had taken it a bit easy. Floating ones tilted more in favour Congress; some of the hardcore followers of rebels swayed from Congress to BJP.

Congress tomtomed “**15 months v/s 15 yrs**” plank; Kamal- Diggi tried to take away the take the election away from their individual candidates to a fight for “**Democracy v/s monarchy**”. Congress used the double negative - against Shivraj and Scindia- challenged Jyotiraditya to come on roads for guest teachers and farmers; besides it targeted the individual backstabbers for insulting the people's mandate. BJP played up the card of being a sensitive government – both in Covid as also for providing succour during disasters in earlier Shivraj regime; it harped on unfulfilled and partially fulfilled promises of Congress– esp. the unemployment dole for youth. The party magnified neglect of region and indulged in mud slinging on Kamal – Diggi. Centre too chipped in by the way of Sikh riots report, ED raids on Nath's relatives, raking up Hawala, portraying Diggi as anti-Hindu and appeasing minorities by hiding Tablighis...The worst case scenario **engineered riots** towards the end – even in other parts of the state - to hijack the narrative thankfully didn't happen

Momentum of by polls was with Congress after the massive Jhabua victory but disruption worked as a speed breaker. Saffron campaign in the evolving post Covid scenario converted it to a ramp. Shivraj- BJP fancied their chances on the basis that people of the region got scare of their life in **Shuddh Ke Liye Yuddh** –Gwalior-Chambal is the adulterated milk product capital of India...These polls were most crucial in a long time as they impacted beyond merely victory in a few seats to saving the government. Moreover, the linkage with Local Bodies, Panchyat and student body polls across the state added to the criticality.



In Cricketing Parlance, **Kamalnath turned out to be a Kohli not a Dhoni.** An excellent player but not a leader ; more like a corporate captain than a statesman. He delivered the **best first quarter of any CM of the state in past 25 yrs** but has been perhaps among the worst - if not worst –Mukhya Sewak. **Shivraj** , on the other hand has Emerged as pre-suspension **Steve Smith** – Superb player but a cheat .**Longest serving CM who never came thru the front door**. Perhaps the **Best Mukya Sewak** of the state ever but among the worst CM's – if not the worst. Round two offers an opportunity for Kamalnath to do a Dhoni ( The best short format player-cum- captain/ Best Single term CM) and Shivraj to become Steve Smith post suspension ( Best Test Player / Good Governance).

Irrespective of outcome of by polls, the spectre of **mid- term** polls loomed large for while. The Karnataka Model was cited but there the turncoats were both winners -Scindia and Shivraj were losers ; besides , Shivraj is no Yedurappa and most importantly turncoats were also from a third party not merely principal opponents . Those Mla's were leaders in their own right and not living in reflected glory of a Scindia like leader. The Bihar and Maharashtra cases too are not comparable since the entire parties switched sides- that too in broad daylight. In our view, mid-term poll would have been **fair** for each player -one who got more seats and the other with more votes gets one quarter – and performances could be compared. Citizens do not care who wins as long as battle is hard fought and fair. Only a true and fair fighter can deliver fair and just governance. The state hoped to get rid of the various stages of **Corona as well as Coronation virus** in the same time frame. History too pointed in that direction- the SAMVID government fell shortly afterwards. A Mid term poll could have been an indicator of how many outsiders have come and the outward exposure of locals- whether the state is ready for next level of politics. When will this subversion- disruption cycle end ? Only in the **Long term** - till there are Madhya Pradesh based regional parties and non- overlapping agenda .

To sum, **second edition** of the series follows ( *series ka Doosra ank Abhi Baki Hai* ) ...shooting commenced immediately at the end of first ...; Mission Kamal 2.0 v/s Operation Lotus 2.0 in progress; Action , drama ,treachery , money ,violence , suspense , thriller .Bagi v/s Bagi ; Daagi v/ s lagi ; Dacait v/s lathait ( Rebels v/s Dacoits). 2018 was the **toughest ever electoral**

**battle of a big state – 2020 the dirtiest ever battle for a region,2023** is likely to be **toughest –cum-dirtiest** war for a **big state**.

\*\*\*

**P.S :**                                    SECOND EDITION OF THE SERIES

Episode 1- Oath taking & Budget session , Cabinet formation.

Episode 2- By Polls .

Episode 3- Investors meet; Cabinet expansion .

Episode 4- Monsoon session.

Episode 5. - Local Bodies’ election.

Episode 6 –Appointments to corporations.

Episode 7- Winter session .No Confidence motion.

Episode 8- Post VS elections till LS polls 2024.

\*\*\*\*\*

## VII .                                    **CITIZENS’ REPORT CARD**

(3 YEARS OF SHIVRAJ )

### GOOD/ POSITIVE

- Vaccination Drive.
- Effective last mile delivery.

\*\*\*

- Announcing State Statistical service.
- Heritage *Mahua* wine./ Kadaknath rearing to tribal SHG’s.

\*\*\*

- Proportional supplementary Income : “ *Laadli Behna*”.
- Massive Infra spend.(Govt . Capex spending increased)

\*\*\*

- Creating ecosystem for start ups./Stand ups.
- Participatory approach (Crisis mgmt committees ; PESA initiated , pre-draft discussions on Budget , youth policy etc.)

### BAD / NEGATIVE

- Covid Mismanagement ( Both lives & Livelihood : Health system collapse Migrant labour crisis ; *Aapda Mein Awasar* : milking the crisis : for cronies).
- Hardening of *Hindutva* stance ( More virulent against Muslims; Communalisation )

\*\*\*

- A darker version of Modi template ( no place for opponents –agencies unleashed on them ; Double engine Shivraj Model (becomes double negative on downturn)
- Biggest slide in Human resources .

\*\*\*

- Lying in Assembly ( About Covid deaths ,Farmers loans)
- Govt. by cheating ( No cabinet for the longest period)

\*\*\*

- Data dark (No documentation of Covid crisis)
- Resource colonization ( Disproportionate water share to neighbouring states , dirt cheap land to dysfunctional industries ; long term- upto 50 yrs - mining contracts to cartels )

\*\*\*

- Dabang style of administration...Committed bureaucracy More of the same (opportunity cost) (same schemes relaunched )
- No big industries in Sunrise areas - lack of Ecosystem.

\*\*\*

**P.S.** : If positive is as almost much as dark – how is Shivraj the worst CM ? .. It is due to lack of ratio in governance and skewed proportion in administration .Opportunity cost due to mindlessly following the central schemes and reviving own defunct programmes ...However , he is arguably the Best Mukhya Sewak till date..CM only for self , coteries, cronies , cartels,mafia ,party and Mukhya Sewak for the rest. ..The story of Shivraj 4.0 is like :

- “ATM” *nirbhar Se Atmnirbahar*”( From Scindia dependant to self -reliant)
- “ *Tiger Zinda Hai Se Ek Tha Tiger*”( From Tiger lives on to Once there was a tiger )

- *Mukhiya se Maukhik Mantri* (From Headman to Blabbering Minister )
- ***Tamanche Se Charra*** ( From Lt. Governor to Lieutenant )

\*\*\*

Overall , the Journey of state in this phase appears to be like a different version of the same script

- *Khaddan ,Makaan , Dukaan* – The triple loot points of saffron brigade ( Massive illegal mining and long term leasing , Regularising over 6K unauthorized colonies, all master plans have prime residential land commercialized )
- M.P. subjected to twin tools of global domination this century-Resource colonization and data mining.
- The state in line to become an Internal colony( gap with other developed states widening , all inter state agreements tilted against M.P. etc)
- *Ajab-Gajab Se Ajebo Gareeb* ( Wonderful- Amazing to Weird -Crooked )

### **Scams & Mafia**

- Nursing college beds scam .
- Patwari recruitment exam scam.
- Agri scams( MP agro 100cr shady work order , horticulture scam, Over 1 lakh farmers' Kisan Nidhi amount in bogus accounts )
- Food scams ( FPA scam ,PDS scam , distributing inedible rice to tribals)
- Chitfund scam.

\*\*\*

- Mininig Mafia (Not allowing those outside the cartel ,excessive illegal mining during Covid , lease for 50 yrs.)
- Liqour mafia (Continuous fliop flop thru the term ,Composite shops)
- Medical mafia ( Concentrating all medical colleges in major cities ,Ayushman card dishonoured )
- Education mafia ( Proliferation of Private Universities ,Students from others states provided cheap degrees ,even fake ones)

\*\*\*

## Some Data Points

### Positive

- 5 cr. People Vaccinated- at the highest rate in the country .
- 6.5 Lakh Houses built under PM Housing
- SHG's given 2 K cr .
- Over 5 000 km roads worth 8 K cr built – highest number of rural roads.
- *Jal Jeevan* Mission – 47 L Houses connected with tap water.
- 21K hectare Govt land released from Land mafia
- 10 L beneficiaries given 5 k cr for self-employment .
- Irrigation capacity increased from 7 L Hectare to 45 LH from 2003-2023.

### Our take

- While this is perhaps a success story, there are reports of some people simply clicking their Aadhar no. in Site / Selfie in remote areas as the pressure to achieve targets mounted .
- Under Housing for all by 2022 – 9.5 L houses were to be built ; 1.5 yrs after the deadline ,only 66% have been constructed ..The revised deadline is 2024 –given the past record , it is impossible.
- Average comes to 10k p er person in SHG's-tokenism?
- Many of them are toll roads - How can govt. Take credit?
- Only a minor fraction of the target - Piped water for all by 2022 .
- Point is that most of the land grab happened during the 18 yr rule of the same govt.- They created land mafia.
- Average merely 50 K per person for self- employment –Symbolism?
- Irrigation target of 65 L Hect.in 2025 – Unlikely in the light of fact that it took 20 yrs to grow from 7 to 47L , hence impossible in 2 yrs.

### Grey ( Misleading data)

- Make M.P. a 1 trillion dollar economy by 2025 –in response to PM's goal of 5 trillion economy.

- GDP growth at 16%
- GST 3k cr.
- Ken Betwa Link – will provide .8 L hect irrigation :

### Our take

- When Maharashtra , Tamil Nadu , Karnataka , U.P. & Odisha have all announced their goals of 1 trillion each ,where is the space for M.P. having a goal of 1 trillion... Hence it has been subsequently revised to 550 Billion dollars.
- In the light of 24 % shrinkage -16% growth is actually negative
- GST less than Rajasthan (3.4k cr), less than one third of U.P -among BIMARU states.
- All the claims of previous schemes to actual irrigation of Land –do not match.

### Dark

- 88 L domestic users get relief of 6 Kcr in electricity bills.
- 6 50 new industrial units with promised investment of over 40 K cr .
- No of unemployed registered upto 40 lakhs.
- Cumulative debt stands at over 3.5 L crores ..Higher than the state budget.

### Our take

- Companies earned much more – without commensurate electricity production- under the minimum guarantee agreement...A repeat scandal of previous terms.
- By that token for the promised jobs of 1 L per month at least 1 L cr investment needed.
- Aim of 1L jobs- that too unfulfilled –is too little , too late.
- Madhya Pradesh's case cannot be compared to other developed states which too have high debts ...Besides, most of the money borrowed at high rates from the market .

### Dirty

- Only 10 K covid deaths.

- About migrant labour being catered to.

### **Our take**

- By all estimates- mathematically , by local experts as well as W.H.O. data –the actual deaths By Covid were one lakh – ten times the official figure.
- Max no. of migrant labour passed thru M.P. in between lockdowns- suffered the most , many died (incl. a few mowed down by a goods train)

### **Overall :**

- Lest any political outfit feel elated or deflated by the above , cold fact is that all parties have fallen short of realizing the state's potential...Both major ones have ruled for decades ..Only one data point could be a hint..In 1956, at the time of formation M.P. was ranked 15<sup>th</sup> and in 2023 too its position is the same ( By the way ,India was Sixth biggest economy at Independence -5<sup>th</sup> now; Its per capita was 20 PC of Global per capita then then – is roughly the same ) ...Development sans progress.Running on treadmill –in the same place ? With the same Model and approach ,same scenario would be repeated in 2047 ( 100 yrs. After independence )

\*\*\*

### **Our Predictions proven Correct / wrong**

- We'd Predicted 19-9 (Cong: BJP) in 28 by polls - it was the reverse.( Only totally off the mark / reverse prediction about central Indian region in 22 yrs.: After 1998 .Reasons- We had never accounted for over 50% darkness/ dirty tricks...Covid Bypolls had much greater darkness than 50%-Candidates bought , total misuse of machinery , threats , media control esp. due to Covid etc...We have since improved our formula to account for upto 93.25% darkness ...Correct prediction of Damoh despite having little/ no credible data from ground is encouraging...Will have to wait for more evidence to authenticate it...Thus only one prediction wrong in 25 yrs and numerous correct.
- Bench marks for Municipal Bodies .Going by the VS ratio it ought to BJP: Congress – 9:7 ; in reality BJP controlled all 16 municipal co

corporations .So, in public perception any loss would be viewed as Congress' gain... Our prediction was **on Dot**.

## **VIII . CITIZENS' VISION : M.P. IN A POST COVID WORLD**

### **VISION -2047/56**

- **POLITICS-CUM-POPULISM** ( Vidhan Sabha- cum -Vidhan Parishad ; Local bodies - cum-political Aldermen ; empowered Panchayats - cum -enabled Gram Sabhas ; 50 p c seats-cum-50 pcvotes mandatory ,else alliance / coalition or making voting mandatory for all bills ... ; In VS , it is representatives - cum-constitution :majority – cum -total, In Vidhan Parishad it is Leaders – cum-Tradition/ Vidhan: future – cum-eternal; Swing state ; Kingmaker leaders; Student body elections unorganized – it is not student organisation election; diversified Plurality.; meritorious/sport-art achievers auto members of the council : Election-cum- selection )
- **ECONOMICS -CUM- FREEBIES** ( Growth – cum-activity ; GDP-cum-per capita : least divide –cum-max employment ; sustainable – cum maintainable ; PPPP:Public-peoples'-Private-Partnership ; Axially circular Economy . ; **Mixed Hybrid economy** )  
\*\*\*
- **CULTURE-CUM- CIVILISATION** ( Most Hindi dialects; Hindwi- cum Hindustani ; Triveni culture ,metro- urban- rurban culture / megacity & rural culture least): Soft power hub of India
- **LIVABLE-CUM-HABITABLE** ( Cleanest , peaceful , conservation , protection, moderate climate, harmonious, safe )  
\*\*\*
- **OPTIMAL HUMAN INTELLIGENCIES -MATERIAL INDICES MATCH** ( Best Intelligence testing and resource mapping ; Divine superhuman development) ;BestGEI :Gender Equity Index;Global; Global Indices rationalizing; projecting own indices.; lifestyle matching intlligencies way of life matching indices.
- **CLEANEST DATA - MATH HYPOTHESIS** ( Math projection and statistical modelling )  
\*\*\*



- **BACK ROOM OFFICE-CUM- WORKSHOP** of India ( Other states outsource their work in the same ratio as the world outsources to India . Workshop of India / Skills capital.( Global skills park ; exporting skilled labour ).
- **ORGANIC CORE –CUM- WILD LIFE HUB** of India ( Food basket , wildlife hub , forest maximum / carbon sink ...).
- \*\*\*
- **LOGISTICS -CUM -TRANSPORT HUB** of India .( Dry ports , truckers capital )
- **LEAST UNEMPLOYMENT- CUM-MAXIMUM SELF EMPLOYMENT** / stand ups ( Urban employ guarantee - unemployment dole ).
- \*\*\*
- **BALANCED IMMIGRATION- MIGRATION** ( skilled migration- Mp has max. number of recent migrants as well as max number of aboriginals
- **JUST –CUM- FAIREST** state of India ( best Justice ecosystem- fairest media space )
- \*\*\*
- **MOST WOMEN/CHILDREN -CUM – SENIOR CITIZEN FRIENDLY** state( Women empowerment , women enabling ).
- **LEAST CORRUPT STATE-CUM- MOST TRANSPARENT STATE** ( Lok Pal - cum-Lok Jan pal ).

\*\*\*

### CRYSTAL GAZING

#### Political

**BJP-** Likely approach is to target the biggest guns of Congress- Nath and Diggy- - hoping for breakdowns .

**Cong-** In all likelihood ,will keep targeting the twin mascots- Shivraj and Jyotir – hoping for cracks to appear.

**Our take** The by poll / Local body / Panchayat elections further finetuned the rearranged equations- between Scindia and BJP ; Kamalnath and Digvijay : Shivraj and VD Sharma to name a few...At the moment, both parties are hapless bystanders to duopolies . The Wolf- Hyena( Kamal-Diggy) of Congress hanging around Mahatma Gandhi statue and Scorpion -Cobra (Shiv-Jyotir) of BJP stationed on a Shivlinga... You cannot shoot them with hand nor hit them with a *chappal* / fire shots...So, the organizations will wait for things to sort themselves out . Since all four are going for the bust – anyone crossing their paths would be at life risk( Manak Agarwal discovered it the harder way) . It could be that the ecosystem changes and / or cracks appear within the duos.... Which partnership is more likely to win ? If the ecosystem is made grey/ dark/ dirty/ shady/ grassy ( foul mouthing ,cheating , lying ,conspiring , communal incidents , scripted clashes etc ) the venomous duo has an edge and if the scenario is dragged towards positive / pure / open (fair play ,rewarding loyalty , adhering to “only fair is fair in war and love” as against the conventional “All is fair...etc) the carnivores will prevail.(Attempting to flatten the masters of dark with increasing darkness will be suicidal.)

### Electoral

- Overall it is going to be the toughest fight till date- which results may not reflect in first past the post system ...
- Capital/ Money and technology (esp.A.I) will have a much greater role
- Strategists and surveyors will call the shots.
- Language – esp. on social media - is likely to touch the lowest common denominator
- Personal attacks will increase more than ever- as the voting day approaches.
- At the last Moments there would be gimmicks- esp. from BJP.
- Congress holds a slight **edge**- based on it playing the victim card and papering over the internal divide.
- BJP has a tough task to even match last time performance given the Shivraj , Maharaj , *Naaraj* and Central factions besides natural anti-incumbency and remnants of Covid pain.

## Leaders

### Shivraj

As the longest serving BJP CM he did try to deepen his influence in Madhya Bharat and beyond , organise some political role for his wife and son- with limited success... On his part , Shivraj has plateaued politically- he has got nothing much to aspire. For , becoming PM is a near impossibility ; Modi- Shah will not trust him for Party President–Ideally he'd want to be in the CCS and have his own man as CM in MP .Upper limit for denouement is 2024.

The reverse countdown started after West Bengal polls..Chouhan survived and neutralised “Pokhrans” waiting after 2022 UP elections-thanks largely to Covid period ....RSS was loathe to allow him beyond 2022- further Congressification of BJP was anathema ; he survived yet again as Chouhan has a lot of powder against RSS state unit to blast them ... Modi -Shah cannot risk him beyond 2023- shutting off contenders for PM ship ...In case Chouhan manages to hang in till 2024 LS elections- with Scindia he is a 30 MLA rump dominant in two regions(Madhya Bharat & Gwalior Chambal) , competitive in two more and spoilsport in the rest- Scindia cannot afford him beyond 2024 ...

In worst case scenario , he could go down first de facto Congress CM of BJP ... At this moment , he is now like someone with RDX tied to his body and guns in both hands .If you shoot him , you too will die with RDX blast ; he may kill you and escape but the option of others killing Chouhan without disproportionate collateral damage is foreclosed after his comeback... He is likely to strike many a compromise in between and wait till the next best opportunity. Hoping for Modi-Shah to weaken a bit ...Else may be left with no other option than to form a Central Indian regional party with Scindia.( provided Jyotir too is sidelined /dumped by BJP )

### **Kamalnath**

Last chance to redeem his Political management guru image .Also, to stamp his mark over the Congress structure in the state. Besides , preparing a lifetime base for his son to carry the legacy. Tweaked the corporate approach of banking too much on strategists and data without matching consultants and

theory –meeting people- to avoid his lifetime record from being dented. His last shot at Eletoral politics , else LS would be his last .. if loses VS , will not stay PCC chief ... any further could be RS route ... Can gain satisfaction having given his best shot for the post as also to revive the party. Result s were glimpsed in 2018 , began emerging in Local Bodies Elctions and likely to become isible sooner or later – most likely in 2023.

## **Digvijay**

Final chance to correct the bumbling image .While West Bengal mayhave been the highest ambition for saffron party , holding their fortress in M.P. is their biggest concern. Now that he has got his feet on ground , Diggy is the only man to take RSS head-on . His half a century of political acumen will be under a question mark if he cannot enthuse the party workers at grassroots. Having taken responsibility of 66 seats which Congress has lost multiple times ,Diggi is in a pole position- everything would be a bonus...He overturned the royal equations in Gwalior Chambal by usurping Madhavrao but still paid lip service .. If he succeeds , the last bit of Royalty would be confined to palaces.

## **Scindia**

Out of the big four, he has got maximum at stake ...In the short term , he wasn't able to get his remaining supporters accommodated in BJP o rganisation , discontent began ; in middle term he didn't get a matching leverage in selecting candidates for local bodies as used to be the case while he ws inCongress , things became grave ; some relief came when Scindia manged to get disproportionate number of his men Corporations and Boards (six members) Now , the litmus l test is whether he is able to en sure Assembly ti ckets to all his supporters .Eventually ,if he isn't able to get a better ministry / be in CCS by 2024 , Scindia's gamble may turn out to be a gambit...Forming a multi state regional party in zone of Scindia influence and wherever there is biparty politics remaining.(MP/Raj/CG/Gujarat) – with or without Shivraj –could be an option. The idea is to be a Kingmaker both at state(s) and centre besides chancing to be a King at either

\*\*\*

## Strategies

BJP : Central body has take control ... Jyotir may be limited to Gwalior –Chambal and Shivraj given charge traditionally losing seats.

- Keep the focus on Labharthis- direct beneficiaries.

CONG : The state Unit in full command

- Focus on guarantees .

## Tactics

BJP : Try level best to guide the narrative to emotive issues- away from report card : Ram Mandir , Various Loks – Mahakaal lok etc.

CONG : Keep the narrative focused on intellectual concerns – inflation , un employment , crime against womesn, atrocities on tribals etc.

## Prediction

We'd predicted nearly a year ago that Congress is likely to win . BJP , on the other hand is aiming to make it as close a fight as possible – for Operation Lotus to come into play.

## Seat Projection

Cong : At this point it is likely to win upto **130** seats ( though it is claiming to win over 150) .. It'll need both hard work and miracles to break the Bjp record of 173 sets (winning 175 plus).. lower limit too will improve the LS tally but upper limit will take the LS seats into double figures from the state

**BJP** : As of now , it is difficult to see how it can cross three figures , Party will need a miracle to cross 110 notwithstanding the boast of going for 200 seats.

\*\*\* \*\*

## COVID DOCUMENT

### **IX. COVID- 1/2/3 .**

## COVID MANAGERS

( Leaders , Parties in Covid Period)

**Scindia ( One year of switch over )**

### What was anticipated

- RS seat- Done
- VS tickets in Bypolls to Mla's who crossed over with him-Done.
- Important portfolios to ministers from his camp- Done.
- A place in Union cabinet - Done.(Lightweight-Low funds)
- Incorporation of his supporters in organisational posts of BJP - Disproportionately low .
- Accommodation of his camp ministers who lost the bypolls on Corporations / boards- Disproportionately high
- On the star campaigners list in other assembly polls- Missing .
- Role in 2023 VS elctions - No clarity yet : Part of the organisation committee ... Will have wait and see whether all his deserving followers get VS tickets.

### Reality Check

- In turbo mode since becoming aviation ministers - greenlighting all low hanging fruit – new flight routes , air ports , drone policy et al...he knows that there could be twist any time , so padding his CV as quick as possible.
- At every step they try and snub him to show to the cadre they haven't sold out. In the party office he is addressed - “ *Bhai Saab*”- a departure from his aunt insisting on “ *Shreemant* ”.
- Had to struggle reinstating 2 key ministers back .
- Only managed “promises” of elevated road , Chambal expressway; Shajapur Medical college-Fund allocation low.
- Only a single person in party organization- that too a BSP defector.
- Reportedly 1L supporters have become members of BJP.
- Even his close officer – Municipal commissioner- Transferred unceremoniously from Gwalior.( Inconceivable in Congress rule ).

- KP Yadav often skips his meets- besides taking potshots- rumours of his joining Congress
  - No grand receptions anymore when arriving in Bhopal ;
  - CM once reportedly made him wait 40 min.- could be a gimmick to send a signal that Shivraj is not beholden to him.
  - *Godse Gyan shala* , *Godse Yatra* , Objection to the “*Mahatma*” epithet for Gandhi ”– under his nose in Gwalior
  - Ram statue –a good move-By his acolyte Sisodiya.
  - Unable to get stuff done for which he threatened to hit the streets- farmers , teachers etc,
  - Not included in any key central committee of Nadda .
  - Labeled back bencher by Rahul
- 
- **Our take** - CM in BJP is usually reserved from those having RSS background .Sonawal, h emanta Biswa Sarma may be an exceptions but M.P. is different- being the key saffron state... At the end of it all , he’ll have to weigh the total political capital. In round 1 and 2 he was the winner - getting tickets for his men and choice portfolios ; disproportionate funds ; in round three there is an incremental decrease ; at the end of local bodies and *Panchayat* polls ,picture has changed– less than rational tickets were given to his followers and their performance was even worse. . Post crossing over, his body language as also his demeanour has become somewhat brazen- shorn of *Charishma*. Ultimately , if he cannot change the government , he’ll change politics. The idea appears to be either King or kingmaker - remain in the mix- of M.P. politics always. Perhaps he is aware that he is one half of the most hated duo among political class in M.P.- keymembers of both parties cannot stand them. His Journey has been from *Riyasat* to *Virasat* to *Siyasat*- which complements Shivraj’s trajectory: from *Siyasat* to *Virasat*- as does the joint photo with a tiger poster backdrop. It is a delicate balance- to much tinkering may turn the deal from complementary to cross complementary. Whether a zoo tiger like him can rule the jungle with a Circus tiger remains to be seen....In the meanwhile , they’ll have to continue the circus and Zoo will have to be maintained.

## **Kamlanath**

Positive - Doing a good job of rebuilding the party organization .

- Kept the govt. on toes in VS.
- On the ball in Covid combat – incl. on media.

Grey -

- Inducting Godseite Babulal Chaurasia .
- Stubbornness on the “item remark” – In response to Imardi Devi Jibe- during bypolls

**Our take** - On both counts, Nath could've done better. Only an apolitical person like Mahatma Gandhi could've forgiven and forgotten Godse ( he did ); Also , as Obama said “ In public life you have to compromise sometimes even when you're right “ ; Kamal could've been even more statesmanlike in apologizing for the “ item “ remark...Everyone - incl. the local public- knows that he did not mean it (as shown by the results) but to persist was not worth it.

## **Diggy**

Positive- He was re-accommodated as in charge of ticket distribution in a poll bound state

- Using dialects to communicate in the regions- Bundeli ,Malwi etc.
- Sitting like Old Congressis on the floor- in a circle.

Grey – People from his camp get mixed treatment :While Govind Singh was accommodated as L.O.P. , Manak Agarwal face rough weather in the party.

**Our take** - This should be last such assignment that he'd take up...Now , he must restrict himself to central India for electoral politics. Youngsters in the party should learn how a felicity in dialects and following the Gandhian customs connects with the grassroots. As for Govind Singh and Manak - both tried punching above their weight- seniority is no substitute for merit or winnability. In a sense ,Congress' internal Politics too has become bipolar in M.P –in place of multiple factions earlier. As long as the poles remain complementary ,it'll flourish ; if they were to become cross –complementary a long term disaster will follow.



## Cong

### Positive-

- Correct approach in Damoh- . Banking of traditional Congressi as candidate , focus on highlighting Kamalnath's 15 month rule ; booth to booth marking 80 Mla's and at least 10 workers on each booth ( if even this doesn't work that leaves only man to man marking of RSS workers ); Sticking to the key plank “*Nalayak aur Gaddar*” v/s “*Layak aur Khuddar*”
- On right track - in Orcha – Having a brainstorming session at the town of Ram Raja.; Connects with the Raja/Ram rajya image( Even Samajwadi party had their conclave there)
- Doing Loktantra Samman Diwas on Mar 20- one year of losing power –Promises to deliver on remaining if returned to power.
- *Kisan* call centre- move at becoming interactive.
- Demand : Ghanghoriya - At least VVPAT for Local bodies ,if not ballot papers
- Rahul Gandhi statement about Scindia being snubbed in BJP- perhaps to check exodus at the last moment.

### Grey

- Not following Covid appropriate behavior during rallies.

**Our take** - Sending the right signals by associating with governance- RamRajya aspect .Damoh provided a template for Municipal /Local Bodiess' &Panchayat elections- one on one marking-even if that means importing Congress workers from other states .On the other hand , the party fails to learn –neither from history nor from its own experience - that “ reverse” Dacoits call themselves *Baaghi* - that Gwalior Chambal is a “ reactionary” ( not “rebel”) belt . From 1857 thru 1968 to Rakesh Chowdhary – and now Jyotiyaditya. Marathas themselves were not blue blooded , Scindias / Shindes even lower , Vijay Raje being from a relatively humble background made matters worse- to expect “regal” behaviour from them is naive...Both the demand for ballot papers as also for VVPAT are justified.

## **BJP-**

### Positive

- Stationing Muralidhar Rao in Bhopal
- RSS- Stationing *Sah Karyavah* in Bhopal .
- Grey- Rumbblings among the regional satraps - Ajay Vishnoi , Narayan Tripathi etc.
- Raking the flimsy issue of State plane used for ferrying Nehru's cigarettes.

### Dark

- Changing equations within new BJP in MP and RSS.

**Our take** - Party knows that *Khela Hobe*- sooner than later. This is the Model farm – cannot be allowed to slip. That's why they tested a secret Module for Local bodies in Damoh by elections...Launching all the defected ministers to campaign...It is cheeky to criticize Nehru for extravagance - some overenthusiastic lackey may have done it –when their own CM holds the record for being frequently flier aboard the state plane.

\*\*\*

**P.S .:** On a broader level , none of the leaders acted proactively to prevent Covid – at least reduce the extent – nor did the parties set an example by even conducting a single rally with Covid appropriate behavior. Being the role models and trend setters ,it may not be an overstatement to say that they are Covid culprits.

\*\*\*

## **FIRST YEAR COVID** **Benchmarking of Covid** ( Comparision -All India)

- Did MP top in testing ? –No ( It was not even in top 10)
- What about tracking ? Almost non- existent after unlockdown.
- Lockdown- strictest and sudden.
- Surveys- Almost none ; Banking on Central data.

- Health Infra ramping - Mostly announcements nothing on ground after one year barring one major previously sanctioned hospital in Indore and extension in Bhopal no new ones established ; no engagement with drug or vaccine manufacturing ; ramping up of Oxygen bottling only after the second wave ...Only minor stuff such as masks and PPE kits organised – that too for internal consumption  
( Compared to Bimaru States )
- Politically –Bihar did better , Rajasthan too ( survived toppling).
- Economically-Better migrant labour management ( Rajasthan)  
( Compared to other BJP states )
- Gujarat - Built hospitals , faster vaccination.

\*\*\*

### Some Observations

#### Positive:

- Capping the Limits of testing , treatment cost - in Pvt .Hospitals - a good move though little late in the day.
- Distributing *Kaadha* to boost immunity

#### Grey

- MP though with a low rate of infection reacted poorly resulting in a high mortality rate.
- Little or no help to migrant Labour -max. no of migrants belonged to M.P or passed thru the state...Many suffered ...few even got mowed down by a train.
- Shivraj performed badly -

#### Dark

- The least percentage of testing – even among the ten bottom states.
- Niti Aayog report places MP health system - near the bottom.

\*\*\*

### Our take

- The status of M.P. at the end of Covid 1.0 can be gauged by some **key indices** -Lowest testing ; highest mortality rate; highest number of crimes against women , children and elderly.; highest infant mortality ; big unemployment ; one of the biggest GDP shrinking( Between 12.5-25 % ).; de-industrialisation.
- Given his understanding of philosophy, Chouhan was able to imbibe the best practices but a lack of understanding of Math-Science prevented him from incorporating Unique approaches tailor-made for M.P.

\*\*\*

### **Covid 2.0 ( After One year )**

#### Positive

- M.P. among the top states in vaccinating its frontline workers ?
- 3 yr post covid Road map ;
- Roadmaps of local bodies ;
- Best and earliest implementation of Central schemes ( Hawkers , Agri Mandis etc.)

#### Grey

- 2nd most Infected after Maharashtra.
- 10 districts under lockdown again in Phase I , Entire state subsequently
- Poor distribution of vaccine shortage in worst hit regions of initial phase –Betul , Burhanpur etc.
- Ventilator shortfall - Bhopal JP hospital ;
- Oxygen shortage -Hamidia- Oxygen plant took nearly a year to commission.; Oxygen related death in People's hospital ,Citi Hospital etc in Bhopal; Shahdol.
- Vishnoi tweet about disproportionate Oxygen consumption . Hinting at corruption and / or incompetence.

#### Dark

- 14 lakh unemployed .
- Ramdesivir theft from the biggest Govt. Hospital in the state.
- Blackmarketing. Fake injections

- More than half of those slipping below poverty line in India in 2020 from M.P ( highest percentage ).

**Our take** - Shivraj continued to stumble and fumble - Covid 2.0 was worse as the approach remained unchanged... Vaccine production requires more than 200 individual components, which are often manufactured in different places. These include glass vials, filters, resin, tubing and disposable bags- M.P. not take a lead even in a few . Announcement for 19 Oxygen plants was done in Oct .2020 with Feb 2021 deadline...Not a single materialized on the scheduled date.(If numerous plants could be activated in a short time later- surely , at least some of them could have been commissioned earlier ).Roadmap for next 5 years of local bodies at the fag end is intellectual theft- preparing them for party at public cost.

\*\*\*

COVID 3.0 ( TILL THE END OF March 2022-Shivraj 2.0 yrs.)

Positive - Vaccination drive efficiently handled.

Grey - Shortchanging the low and vulnerable among Covid workers – Aanganwadi workers , nurses , Ayush doctors , interns etc - their remunerations with held , contracts not extended , annulled , no benefits of Covid heroism.

Dark – Hiding the number of Covid related deaths .

**Our take** –Eventhough there were some reports of vaccination being fudged with staff merely punching Aadhar nos. & selfies under pressure to meet target and reluctance of many (esp. in tribal / rural areas ) to take it, the vaccination drive was a success. \*\*\*

**Covid**

Positive

- Pension scheme for Corona orphans 500- first in M.P’
- M.P. among top in vaccinating frontline workers
- IISER comes up with a monitoring system about efficacy of the Vaccine.
- Corona volunteers mooted - engaging those who overcome Corona.

- Prior arrangement for third wave - Pediatric wards.
- CM touring Shahdol - focused approach on most infected ,
- Post Covid care too designed- esp. black fungus.

### Grey

- Crisis management committees constituted in each village.
- Trying to evolve a “ M.P Model” Midway thru Covid 2.0. A 5 point approach– Identifying , testing , treating , tracking and vaccinating-
- Nearly 500 migrant labourers who return to Chhattarpur /Mahoba provided relief.

### Dark

- Vaccine discrimination ; tribal areas bereft of most key medicines as also lowest vaccine allocation.

### **Our take-**

- The crisis management committees were loaded with ruling party members-with an eye on local bodies' elections; they should have been apolitical besides being complemented by experts and intellectuals...
- Same flaw in approach - a *Thaali* /plethora of lot of small steps but no big / game changing / unique/ special move... no big hospitals , no vision beyond three years.. Not clear how M.P. model is different from other states ? No visible USP- Uptil now - could be angling towards status quo- best among BJP ruled BIMARU states but still behind Non- BJP Rajasthan and Jharkahand.

**X :**

**DARK COVID .**

**MISTAKES OF THE COVID 1.0 REPEATED IN COVID 2.0**

**( Covid crimes)**

- During Covid 1.0 tender for 100cr. worth of medical equipment could not be released for a month since there was no health minister ; in Covid 2.0 too allocation for 19 Oxygen plants announced in Oct 2020 with a Feb 2021 deadline could not be given as the health minister was busy in own re-election first and Damoh by- election later.

- Hiding / fudging data-even by restricting test results in Covid 1.0 ; Hiding/ Fudging Data of Covid 2.0 ( Esp. deaths ).Hiding in Covid 1.0 led to complacency ; hiding in Covid 2.0 led to irrational fear.
- Not engaging the opposition in a rational meaningful ,proportional manner.
- Not involving the institutions –IISER , Disaster Mgmt institute etc.- in a proportional manner....Politics overtook science
- Not documenting extensively.( The vision will go haywire without authentic documentation).

### DARK DATA

- A remote village of population 7000 reported 20 cases in the Month of April...Assuming it to be the worst case scenario a back of the envelope math tells as that considering 15 deaths to be routine there could be 70 deaths a year or 6 deaths a month ; So there were 14 deaths extra in April ; Extrapolating 14 extra/Covid death in a population of 70 K comes to 1 lakh 40 thousand extra / Covid deaths in the state wide population of over 7 crore ...Hence even by conservative estimates there have been over **1 lakh Covid deaths in Madhya Pradesh already** – which is roughly 20 times the reported / official figures (A fact matched by the data from crematoria ).
- Out of 61 people from Gyaraspur (in Vidisha District) who visited Kumbh Mela in Uttrakhand 60 were found Covid Positive on return ...They are the real super spreaders...KumbhCorona.
- Cases in Damoh shot up manifold immediately after by poll...The rallies were biggest super spreaders.
- None of the home grown moneybags / corporates pitched in the Corona fight – at least not proportionately... Primary reason appears to be that most / all of these are cronies – their overenthusiasm may show the government in poor light which in turn may risk contracts.

### DARK FACTS

- None of the Hindu Temples came out to help in a big way nor did mosques – at least not proportionately – say in comparison to Sikhs.

- The Social service organisations- esp. the RSS & Sewa Dal too were missing in action mostly .
- Other states reported black marketing of Ramdesivir ; Madhya Pradesh witnessed Fake Ramdesivir being injected.
- Other states reported black marketing of Plasma; Madhya Pradesh Reported fake Plasma ( Gwalior)- even W.H.O. took note of it.
- Blamed Minorities to be super spreaders without evidence-Tat Patti Bakhal , tablighi Jamaat, Death of children , Labour by trains .
- Discrimination - As it is, medical infrastructure is disproportionately tilted towards cities –(70% infrastructure caters to 30% population)- The Covid aid further skewed it ; smaller cities received less than their share of Ramdesivir , ventilators , oxygen concentrators – tribal areas got the least.

P.S. : It is for the above reasons that Madhya Pradesh has turned from “dark” to “dirty” heart of India.

- FDI post Covid : Negligible :no industries relocating from China landed in M.P.
- No specifics given on 1 L cr( 33K crores in first 10 months) borrowed from market in Corona - not to speak of the money saved on housekeeping. Even the Economic survey ,presented at the last hour painted a harrowing picture –GDP down by nearly 4 %; per capita slipped by 5 thousand rupees, unemployed stood at around 25 lakhs after first year, Mining dipped by 16 % (illegal mining manifold)...Reality likely to be worse at the end– informal figures hint at a dip of more than 5%, more than 40 Lakh unemployed and the dip in mining despite overdigging due to illegal activity
- About one Lakh vaccines missing after arrival
- Covid1.0 was the worst year in State’s history.
- Kill Corona 2.0 Campaign failed.

### COVID MATH REVISITED

At the outset we had projected that :



- Over half (50%) the population could be infected ( 40 pc in rural and 60 in urban areas ) across two years ( Four waves ) - could go up to 70pc.- Before **herd immunity** sets in.
- At most 25 % of the infected will need medical attention / oxygen.
- Normally only 12.5 % of those infected will need preliminary medication / Prophylactics ( Ramdesivir , Tocilizumab et al ).
- Only 6.25% of the infected will need intensive medication .(Steroids - dexamethasone )
- Only 3.12 % of the infected will fall seriously sick ventilators (at a given point in time)
  - Only 1.6 pc of those infected will die .

( It is observed that even at peak , Covid kills 3500-4000 per million ; a wave takes about 49 days to peak - thus a cycle runs roughly six months )

Based on the above , the worst case scenario if the government did nothing at all- No masks , no lock downs , no social distancing , no sanitization-

- Will see 2 cr infected in rural areas and 1.2 cr in urban areas over a period of 2 yrs.
- Out of which 10 lakhs may fall seriously sick
- Upto 4 lakh people could die.; 3 lakh additional than regular deaths (approx 1 L)
- In the mid case scenario 1 lakh people may die
- Ideally 65 thousand people will die .

At the other extreme , if government did everything possible : Perfect scenario -93.25% or more surveys ; 87.5% or more testing; 81.25% (of the infected) tracking ; 75% (of the infected) isolating ; 68.75% (of the infected) medical consultation; 62.5%(of the infected) treating ; 56.25% vaccinating ; 50%(of the treated) oxygenating ; 6.25% (of the infected) ventilating....Overall, If **everything** possible is done , **at most 6.25** lakh people per crore . population could get infected and( **Average** is 2.5 lakh infections per crore people) -less than 1% of the infected die. In case of M.P with approx. 8Cr Population

- Between 25-50 L infections

- Between **25-50 K** Deaths (that figure has already been crossed unofficially )

**P.S.** Thus at the end of pandemic , with only around 35L cases and **35K** Covid deaths( Maximum ) govt. Could be marked **perfect** ; with over 3.5 cr infections and upwards of 3.5L Covid deaths(minimum) the govt. could be labeled non – existent. **Zero rating**. Anything higher than that - upto 6.8L deaths- the government could in fact be marked **negative** : meaning that there would've been lesser deaths if there was no government. In the last case scenario , court's observation of initiating criminal charges upon another state government may not be out of place for Madhya Pradesh Government too.

\*\*\*

**P.S :** Going by the above , M.P. government's performance in Covid Management was **mediocre**. (Since 1 Lakh P eople died )

\*\*\*

#### Miscellaneous Benchmarks :

- At least one Covid appropriate rally ;
- Citizens' manifesto .
- Report card .
- More devolution to Panchayats.

**P.S:** On the basis of above benchmarks Madhya Pradesh Performed poorly as anly one aspect -Citizens' manifesto- was sketchily p repared.

\*\*\*

#### **Our Advocacy Incorporated**

- Reforming the model of governance-Covid cabinet
- Tweaking Model of administration-Categorised administration.
- Enquiry in to the Agri officers recruitment mess-PEB
- Best Local Body working-Indore already No.1.
- Media - Collating Covid experiences.
- Blowing the Siren every morning/evening as reminder.
- Forming a Committee of experts- Covid Commission mooted.

- Engaging final year medical / Nursing student- giving them Corona Experience certificates as value addition/ preferential treatment in future Government openings.( Exhort the Private medical hospitals too to do the same ).
- Our advocacy of postponing both – Local Bodies’ & Panchyat polls -till at least half the population got vaccinated eventually accepted.

### **Our Covid Predictions vindicated**

- Second wave will surely come
- A relatively more severe strain likely in the second wave
- It’ll hit the less infected section of first wave.

\*\*\*

### **Overall Covid Evaluation**

#### Positive

- Pension scheme for Corona orphans 500/- first in M.P.
- M.P. among top in vaccinating frontline workers
- IISER comes up with a monitoring system about efficacy of the Vaccine.
- Corona volunteers mooted - esp. those who’ve overcome Corona.
- Prior arrangement for third wave - Pediatric wards.
- CM touring Shahdol - focused approach on most infected ,
- Post Covid care too designed- esp. black fungus.

#### Grey

- Crisis management committees constituted in each village.
- Trying to evolve a “ M.P Model” Midway thru Covid 2.0. A 5 point approach– Identifying , testing , treating , tracking and vaccinating
- Nearly 500 migrant labourers return to Chhattarpur /Mahoba.

#### Dark

- Vaccine discrimination ; tribal areas bereft of most key medicines as also lowest vaccine allocation.

#### **Our take-**

- The crisis management committees are loaded with ruling party members-with an eye on local bodies' elections; they ought to be apolitical besides being complemented by experts and intellectuals.
- Same flaw in approach - a *Thaali* /plethora of lot of small steps but no big / game changing / unique/ special move... no big hospitals , no vision
- At the end of three years.. Not clear how M.P. model is different from other states ? No visible USP- Uptil now - could be angling towards status quo- best among BJP ruled Bimaru states but still behind Non- BJP Rajasthan and Jharkahand.

\*\*\*

## OVERALL COVID 2.0

### Positive-

- Shivraj announcing on streets ( *Mera mask- Meri Suraksha ; Mask nahin to Baat Nahin* )
- Once again a Doctor at helm in Health Deptt .
- M.P maxes teen vaccination drive on Day 1-

### Grey-

- Fudging Covid data over and over again ;
- Tweaking Benchmarks - CT value
- Oxygen supply uneven
- Key medicines- esp. Ramdesivir - black marketed .
- Asking people not to hide their symptom, wear masks , maintain social distance , trust government hospitals etc.
- Castigate - Diggy - Kamalnath of not moving out among people to serve Covid impacted.
- Tops in vaccinating expectant mothers , lags in second dose.:
- M.P model ? Good.
- Nath criticises lifting total covid restrictions at one go amid lurking threat of third wave- should've been phased

### Dark

- Least Tests amount of test among big states ( 13th among large 50 )-even at the end of 3rd wave.

- Health minister is missing in action
- Max . Wastage of vaccine in M.P 16 L ; our take - siphoned off or poor infra ?
- Once again repeating the story of previous wave - the moment cases rise tests reduced instead of vice versa - even below the prescribed minimum of 60 K/ Day ( Ultra of US - where they're sending home Test kits )
- AS Omicron peaks , vaccination reduced By upto 60 pc ( as also testing) ;

Dirty :

- Fudging even the data of deaths- that too manifold – not counting the deaths in private facilities , home isolation deaths ,Covid centre deaths ...even those buried with Covid protocol marked Covid negative.

**Our take** – Just as initially in Covid 1.0 there was no health minister , in Covid 2.0 the incumbent remained busy in Damoh by election. ...Once again the **non-RSS man** (defector-Prabhuram ) given the dirty work – to face all the flak of medical emergencies while the positive spin/ protecting the image can only be entrusted to RSS pedigree ( Vishwas Sarang ).When Narottam Mishra himself had initially defied mask ( he later apologized ); when CM himself had gone to a private facility(not trusting government hospital) ; when government itself is hiding data of visible deaths ; when politicians did not present even one example of Covid appropriate behaviour in political rallies ; when the purveyors of fake Ramdesivir injections are lightly charged for three months due to political connections ; when the culture minister kept advocating yagya , Cowdung etc. as a substitute (not complementary) of Covid treatment- how were Citizens expect to comply ?

Wrong to castigate Kamal -Diggy of not moving out enough in Public...At their own level both did ; Diggy even contacted Covid ; ...Age too is a factor-their sons are more than compensating for it.

**Our take** :imposing lock down late and lifting it early- both without calibration.

\*\*\*